The States' Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability (SFTAS) Program for Results

2019 Annual Performance Assessment (APA) Report

KADUNA STATE

By:

The Office of the Auditor General for the Federation as the SFTAS Independent Verification Agent with support from JK Consulting Co. Ltd

November 2020

Table of Contents

1   Executive Summary

This Report details the outcome of the Annual Performance Assessment (APA) conducted on Kaduna State for the second (2019) year of the four-year SFTAS Program. In conducting the APA, the verification team assessed how the State performed against the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) listed within the SFTAS DLI Matrix, guidelines and verification protocol.

Table 1 (below) reflects the outcome of the 2019 APA for Kaduna State and shows areas where the State achieved results. In total, Kaduna State achieved **7 (seven)** DLRs out of 15 DLRs applicable in 2019 while 3 DLRs were achieved in 2018.

We further identified several areas where the State can improve its performance for the next APA, and these are set out in detail within Section 3 of this report. In summary, the State should ensure the following:

1. DLR 1.1: Budget implementation reports should include, at a minimum, the approved budget appropriation for the year for each organizational unit (MDAs), and for each of the core economic classifications of expenditure (Personnel, Overheads, Capital, and Other expenditures). It should also state balances against each of the revenue and expenditure appropriations. The balances should also be provided on a consolidated basis across the four (4) expenditure classifications.
2. DLR 1.2: Expenditure outturn deviation is reduced to a level within the annual requirements for this result.
3. DLR 5.1: Biometric data of all the State's civil servants and pensioners is captured and linked with the State's payroll to reduce fraud.
4. DLR 8: A Domestic Arrears Clearance Framework (ACF) is established and an internal domestic arrears database with relevant balances placed online through a publicly accessible portal. Domestic arrears are cleared year on year to achieve total reduction in arrears in line with the targets set for this DLR.
5. DLR 9: Strengthening of the State's debt sustainability by achieving the levels of debt indicators that are below the thresholds established for this DLR.

Furthermore, we noted that the debt stock balance obtained from the Federal DMO State Domestic is lower by N98,594,596,192 than the debt stock stated in the audited financial statements for 2019.

Table 1: Assessment Results

Key:	Achieved		Not Achieved		Previously Achieved	

Disbursement Linked Indicators	**Disbursement Linked Results**	**Results**	**Remarks**
DLI 1: Improved financial reporting and budget reliability	DLR 1.1: FY19 quarterly budget implementation reports published on average within 6 weeks of quarter-end to enable timely budget management		The State did not publish the reports online
	DLR 1.2: FY19 deviation for total budget expenditure is < 25%		Budget deviation was 47.72%.
DLI 2: Increased openness and citizens' engagement in the budget process	DLR 2.1: Citizens' inputs from formal public consultations are published online, along with the proposed FY2020 budget.		The minutes of the meeting were jointly signed by CSO representatives.

Disbursement Linked Indicators	Disbursement Linked Results	Results	Remarks
	DLR 2.2: Citizens' budget based on approved FY19 State budget published online by end April 2019.		The Citizens' budget was published on 10 April 2019.
DLI 3: Improved cash management and reduced revenue leakages through implementation of State TSA	DLR 3: TSA, based on a formally approved cash management strategy, established and functional, and covering a minimum of 60 percent of state government finances implementation of State TSA		The TSA covers 105% of the State's finances. *(Higher than 100% because of LGA FAAC inflows)*
DLI 4: Strengthened Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) collection	DLR 4.1: State implementing a consolidated state revenue code covering all state IGR sources and stipulating that the state bureau of internal revenue is the sole agency responsible for state revenue collection and accounting. Code must be approved by the state legislature and published		Previously achieved in 2018 APA.
	DLR 4.2: 2019-2018 annual nominal IGR growth rate meets target: -Basic target: 20%-39%, Stretch target: 40% or more	**Achieved stretch target**	The State achieved 130% growth.
DLI 5: Biometric registration and Bank Verification Number (BVN) used to reduce payroll fraud	DLR 5.1: Biometric capture of at least 75 percent of current civil servants and pensioners completed and linked to payroll, and identified ghost workers taken off the payroll		Biometrics capture was of 52.72% of State's civil servants and pensioners.
	DLR 5.2: Link BVN data to at least 75 percent of current civil servants and pensioners on the payroll and payroll fraud addressed		The State has linked 99.37% of current civil servants and pensioners to BVN.
DLI 6: Improved procurement practices for increased transparency and value for money	DLR 6.1: Existence of public procurement legal framework and procurement regulatory agency. State legal framework should conform to the UNCITRAL Model Law and provide for: 1) E-Procurement; 2) Establishment of an independent procurement regulatory agency; and 3) Cover all MDAs receiving funds from the state budget.		Previously achieved in 2018 APA.
	DLR 6.2: Publish contract award information above a threshold set out in the Operations Manual for 2019 on a monthly basis in OCDS format on the State website		Contracts are published in OCDS format on the state website.
DLI 7: Strengthened public debt management and fiscal responsibility framework	DLR 7.1: State implementing state-level debt legislation, which stipulates: 1) responsibilities for contracting state debt; 2) responsibilities for recording/reporting state debt; and 3) fiscal and debt rules/limits.		Previously achieved in 2018 APA.
	DLR 7.2: Quarterly state debt reports accepted by the DMO on average two months or less after the end of the quarter in 2019		The quarterly debt reports were submitted on average of 6.5 weeks after the end of quarter.
DLI 8: Improved clearance/reduction of stock of domestic expenditure arrears	DLR 8: Domestic arrears as of end 2019 reported in an online publicly accessible database, with a verification process in place and an arrears clearance framework established **and** Percentage decline in the verified stock of domestic arrears at end 2019 compared to end 2018 meets target and is consistent with the state's arrears clearance framework.		State has no Arrears Clearance Framework.
DLI 9: Improved debt sustainability	Total debt stock at end of December 2019 as a share of total revenue for FY2019 meets target: Basic target: < 140%, Stretch target: < 115%. **and** Average monthly debt		Monthly debt service deduction is 8% of Gross FAAC, and the Total Debt

Disbursement Linked Indicators	Disbursement Linked Results	Results	Remarks
	service deduction is < 40% of gross FAAC allocation for FY2019.		Stock to Revenue is 155%

The Office of the Auditor-General for the Federation as Independent Verification Agent and JK Consulting Co. Ltd agree on all the results shown in this report.

2. Introduction

2.1 Overview

The Federal Government of Nigeria is implementing a four-year program to support Nigerian States to strengthen fiscal performance and sustainability: The State Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability (SFTAS) Program for Results ("The Program"). In each of the four years, the Program will finance activities under two components: (i) a Program for Results (PforR) component in the amount of US$700 million and (ii) a Technical Assistance (TA) component in the amount of US$50 million. All States are able to participate in the Program in each of the four years and benefit from the PforR funds by meeting set Eligibility Criteria and any or all the indicators of fiscal transparency, accountability and sustainability.

The Auditor-General for the Federation was appointed as the Independent Verification Agent (IVA) for the SFTAS Programme and JK Consulting Co. Ltd was subsequently engaged to support the IVA. Both parties have worked together to assess the performance of the State against the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) for 2019. To ensure a high-quality assessment, the IVA engaged the services of experts in Taxation, Procurement and Debt Management laws to review the legislation in place for each State.

2.2 Scope

This Annual Performance Assessment (APA) Report covers the State's performance in 2019 against the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) listed within the SFTAS DLI Matrix, guidelines and verification protocol. Each State was earlier assessed against the Eligibility Criteria set in the protocol, to determine the state's eligibility for grants under the 2019 APA. The results of the eligibility assessment were reported previously to each state, and are included in Appendix A.

The verification protocol was set early in the preparation for the Program and all States, implementing agencies and other key stakeholders have been continuously sensitised on the requirements of the program and on the protocol for 2019. The assessment results are binary (Pass or Fail), as that is how the Program for Results was designed.

In advance of the performance assessments, all States were provided with the detailed information requirements for the assessments, a proposed itinerary for the assessment visit and a template with which to report the results achieved. The assessments were conducted between 23/08/2020 and 29/08/2020 with a team of four persons, starting with an opening meeting where all the information requested were handed over. The visit was concluded with an exit meeting where the initial findings were discussed, and the state was given further opportunity to provide clarifications and/additional information.

The draft conclusions from the work done were reported to the State and this final report takes account of the State's comments on the draft results, as shown in Section 4.

The Office of the Auditor-General for the Federation and JK Consulting Co. Ltd are grateful to the States for the cooperation enjoyed during the assessment and hope the recommendations within this Report are found valuable towards achieving the DLRs in the remaining years of the Program.

3. Assessment Results

3.1 Findings

Table 2: Findings

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
DLI 1: Improved Financial Reporting and Budgeting Reliability				
DLR 1.1	**Financial Year [2019] quarterly budget implementation reports published on average within [6 weeks] of each quarter-end to enable timely budget management**		**Not Achieved**	
1	Has the State published its quarterly budget implementation report to the State official website on average within six weeks of the end of each quarter?	The budget implementation report for the FY2019 could not be found on the State official website www.kdsg.gov.ng and www.bpc.kadgov.ng. Hard copies requested were not provided.	Unsatisfactory	The State should ensure all quarterly implementation reports are published within six weeks of the end of each quarter.
2	Do the reports each include, at a minimum, the approved original AND revised (if applicable) budget appropriation for the year against each organizational units (MDAs) for each of the core economic classification of expenditures (Personnel, Overheads, Capital, and others), the actual expenditures for	The budget implementation report for the FY2019 could not be found on the State official website www.kdsg.gov.ng and www.bpc.kadgov.ng. Hard copies requested were not provided.	Unsatisfactory	The State should ensure the budget implementation reports include approved budget appropriation for each of the core economic classifications of expenditure

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
	the quarter attributed to each as well as the cumulative expenditures for year to date, and balances against each of the revenue and expenditure appropriations.			(Personnel, Overheads, Capital, and other expenditures)
3	Does the report State the actual expenditures for the quarter attributed to each MDA and each expenditure classification as well as the cumulative expenditures for year to date?	The budget implementation report for the FY2019 could not be found on the State official website www.kdsg.gov.ng and www.bpc.kadgov.ng, hard copies requested was also not provided.	Unsatisfactory	The State should ensure the reports state the actual expenditures to each MDA and each expenditure classification as well as cumulative expenditures for the year to date.
4	Does the report State balances against each of the revenue and expenditure appropriations with balances provided on a consolidated basis across the four (4) expenditure classifications and 'Other Expenditures' which will include debt servicing, and transfers, or other expenditures not attributable to any of the other three (3) expenditure classifications?	The budget implementation report for the FY2019 could not be found on the State official website www.kdsg.gov.ng and www.bpc.kadgov.ng, hard copies requested was also not provided.	Unsatisfactory	State should prepare budget implementation report with revenue and expenditure appropriations with balances provided on a consolidated basis across the four (4) expenditure classifications

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
DLR 1.2	**FY [2019] deviation from total budget expenditure is less than 25%**		**Not Achieved**	
1	Has the State computed the difference between the original approved total budgeted expenditure for the fiscal/calendar year and the actual total budgeted expenditure in the fiscal/calendar year, divided by the original approved total budgeted expenditure, and expressed in positive percentage terms? Is the expenditure outturn deviation computed less than 25%	The State computed the budget deviation for 2019 to be 47.72% The IVA computed the budget deviation for this APA year. See the computation below:	Unsatisfactory	

BUDGET DEVIATION

	ORIGINAL BUDGET ₦	ACTUAL OUTTURN ₦
Capital	94,476,496,623.41	148,572,05
Recurrent:	62,612,505,237.74	84,007,90
Personnel	31,379,672,497.09	42,864,63
Other recurrent	31,232,832,740.65	41,143,26
Total	157,449,001,861.15	232,579,95

$$\frac{₦157,449,001,861.15 - ₦232,579,958,000}{₦157,449,001,861.15} \times 100\%$$

$$= 47.72\%.$$

The budget performance deviation is 47.72%

However, the State provided a justification that the first tranche of the World Bank loan of ₦63,161,397,595.30 (to finance the Governance and Economic Pillars of the

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
		State Development Plan) previously budgeted for in 2017 and 2018 but was not received due to the Senate's refusal to assent to the loan, resulted in a wide budget deviation in both years. In 2019 the State proposed a conservative budget without capturing the loan based on previous experience, with the intention to revise the budget if the loan is disbursed. The loan was eventually disbursed to the State in June 2019. The IVA notes that an adjustment to exclude expenditures funded from the loan from the deviation calculation will reduce the expenditure deviation significantly. The World Bank loan received was ₦63,161,397,595.30. Source: 2019 Audited Financial Statement Pg. 19 & 20 and Approved Budget and Actual Expenditure or Appropriation Law Pg. 1.		
DLI 2: Increased Openness and Citizens' Engagement in the Budget Process				
DLR 2.1	**Citizens' inputs from formal public consultations are published online, along with the proposed FY [2020] budget**		**Achieved**	
1	Did the State conduct at least one "town-hall" consultation before the proposed budget is drafted with participation of local government authorities and State-based CSOs?	Report on the 2020 budget town hall meeting and attendance list were obtained and reviewed. The IVA team found the following: a) LGAs that were in attendance are Kaura, Kagarko, Kajuru, Chikun, Kubau, Igabi, Birni- Gwari, Sanga,	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
		Soba, Zaria, Lere, Jaba, Kaduna South and Kaduna North. b) CSOs representatives in attendance were Kagoro Youth & Community Development Associate (KYCDA), Coalition of Association for Leadership, Peace, Empowerment and Development (CALPED), Enhancing Community Action for Peace (E-CAPH), Leadership Development Institute (LDI), Nigeria Medical Associate (NMA), Women of Vision Movement, National Youth Council of Nigeria (NYCN), The Nordic Network for Interdisciplinary Environmental Studies (NIES), Amalgamated Commercial Motorcycle and Tricycle Riders of Nigeria (ACOMOCAN), and Mobilizing, Empowering and Development the Nigerian Youth (MEDAN).. c) The sources of information from which our conclusions were drawn were minutes and attendance list. d) The date of the consultation on the budget proposal was October 2, 2019. The venue was Gen. Hassan Usman Katsina House Kawo Kaduna. e) 10 attendees were contacted through the telephone number provided in the attendance list to confirm their attendance at the public consultation and the responses are satisfactory. f) The draft budget was published on October 12, 2019. g) The date of the consultation and the date of the draft budget was compared, the public consultation came first.		

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
2	Were the minutes of the public consultations jointly prepared with CSO representatives (shown by their signature to the minutes) and posted on the official State website, alongside the proposed annual budget on or before 31 January 2020 to enable citizens to find the inputs easily?	One of the CSOs co-signed the Minutes with a government representative. a) The title of the minutes is "Report on the 2020 Expenditure Budget Town Hall Meeting". The consultation held on October 2, 2019. b) The date of online publication of minutes was 4th October 2019 while date of publication of proposed budget was 12th October 2019, before the deadline of 31st January 2020. c) The weblink to the publication is https://pbc.kadgov.ng/upload/pdf/TownHall%20202 0%20Budget.pdfon on the website www.kdsg. gov.ng; published on October 4, 2019. d) See Appendix A for weblinks to the proposed/final budget	Satisfactory	
DLR 2.2 New	**Citizens' budget based on approved FY19 State budget published online by end April 2019.**		**Achieved**	
1 New	Has the State published online, on the State website(s) a Citizens Budget based on the approved FY19 state budget not later than 30 April 2019?	The Citizens budget based on approved FY19 State budget was published before the due date on April 10, 2019. The link is https://openkaduna.com.ng/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/2019-Citizens-Budget2.pdf with assess link from www.kdsg.gov.ng. .	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations

2
 	
New
	Is the Citizens Budget a comprehensible (to citizens) summary of the approved FY19 state budget?	The IVA confirmed that the Citizen's budget is comprehensible (to citizens),a summary of the approved FY19 State budget and in the format suggested to the States.
		It includes 4 out of 5 key budget information from the original budget, including the following:
		
		  i. A simple explanation of the annual budget/citizen's budget.
		  ii. Breakdown of revenues and expenditures.
		  iii. Sectoral Allocation (MDAs by MDAs).
		  iv. Top Projects to be financed.
		  v. Disclosure of Budget deficit and how it will be financed, pg. 6.
		
		The treatment of the budget deficit was not explicit; however, we were able to discern the following from the citizen's budget, and concluded that the likely level of unfunded deficit (financing gap) was minimal.
		
		<table><tr><td></td><td>₦bn</td></tr><tr><td>**Opening balance**</td><td>**16.50**</td></tr><tr><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>**Revenue**</td><td></td></tr><tr><td>IGR</td><td>41.72</td></tr><tr><td>FAAC</td><td>52.00</td></tr><tr><td>VAT</td><td>14.40</td></tr><tr><td>Internal loans</td><td>0.82</td></tr><tr><td>External loans</td><td>16.88</td></tr></table>
			Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings		Conclusion	Recommendations
		External grants	2.94		
		Internal Grants	8.73		
		Sales of Govt quarters	3.00		
			140.49		
		Expenditure			
		Personnel cost	31.74		
		Overhead cost	31.23		
		Capital expenditure	94.47		
			157.44		
		Likely financing gap	-0.45		
DLI 3: Improved Cash Management and reduced Revenue Leakages through Implementation of State TSA					
DLR 3.0	**Improved cash management and reduced revenue leakages through implementation of State TSA**			**Achieved**	
1	Has the State established a functional State-level TSA?	a. The state has established a functional state-level TSA. b. The State operates one account with the CBN with following details: TSA account name: Kaduna State Government Treasury Account (TSA) Account number: 0100126961019		Satisfactory	
2	Is there a formally approved cash management strategy in place? The Strategy should cover the processes through which the State	The State has a cash management strategy. a) The cash management document is titled Cash Management Strategy.		Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
Ministry of Finance or Budgets/Economic Planning is able to forecast cash commitments and requirements and provide reliable information on the availability of funds.	b) It was produced on January 8, 2019 and signed by the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance. c) There is a clause that made provisions for the Strategy to cover the processes through which the State Ministry of Finance can forecast cash commitments and requirements and provide reliable information on the availability of funds. It can be found on pages 6 & 7 of the cash management strategy. d) The strategy does not cover cash sweeping period but this is covered in the TSA Manual e) No evidence of implementation of processes described in the cash management strategy.		
3 Does the TSA have a system of cash management that allows for a central view of cash balances in bank accounts on a single electronic dashboard (based on the approved cash management strategy)?	The State has a computer application where the State can view the cash balances in the bank account(s) centrally on a single electronic dash board. a) The computer application name is KDSG Track Pay, which is internally developed. b) No approval was found in the Cash Management Strategy for the use of the IT application. c) The exact date of deployment of the applications was not given as it was internally developed. However, the State deployed it in 2019 with the intention to officially launch it by 30th September 2020.	Satisfactory	The approval for the use of the computer application should be contained in the cash management strategy.
4 Does the TSA have one consolidated revenue treasury account for State revenues? Revenues collected by MDAs such as service fees no longer	a) The TSA bank for the State is CBN, with details below: TSA account name: Kaduna State Government Treasury Account (TSA)	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
sit in individual MDA accounts at different commercial banks but are brought into the consolidated revenue account as part of the TSA.	Account number: 0100126961019 b) All government monies go through this account. c) All government monies do not sit in the other revenue collecting banks. d) The TSA bank statement was obtained.		
5 Does the TSA cover a minimum of 60% of the State Government's finances?	The IVA computed the total cash inflow and outflow from the TSA account against the total government finances inflows and outflows as contained in the Cash flow Statement for the year ended 2019. See the computation below: |	TOTAL INFLOWS	TOTAL OUTFLOWS
---	---	---
TSA BANK STATEMENT	169,563,827,508.70	170,264,821,441.86
GOVT FINANCES	123,617,130,000.00	232,579,958,000.00
PERCENTAGE	137.17%	73.21% | The average percentage of cash flow was computed as: $$\frac{137.17\% + 73.21\%}{2}$$ **= 105%** The TSA covered 105 % of the State's finances. An Issue report was raised to obtain explanation from the State on how the TSA is able to have cash flows in excess of	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
		Government finances. We understood from the initial response that the TSA includes FAAC receipts on behalf of the 23 Local governments. *Sources: 2019 Audited Financial Statement (Cash flow Statement) Pg. 17 & 18 and the TSA Statement from CBN for the period Jan – Dec 2019).		
DLI 4: Strengthened Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) Collection				
DLR 4.1	**State implementing a consolidated state revenue code covering all state IGR sources and stipulating that the state bureau of internal revenue is the sole agency responsible for state revenue collection and accounting. Code must be approved by the state legislature and published**		**Previously Achieved**	
1	Does the State have up-to-date consolidated revenue code which includes all the State's IGR sources and all the local governments (falling under that State) IGR sources?	This DLR was achieved in the 2018 APA		
2	Does the consolidated revenue code stipulate that the State Bureau of Internal Revenues (SBIR) or the State Internal Revenue Service (SIRS) as the sole agency responsible for State	This DLR was achieved in the 2018 APA		

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
	revenue (tax and non-tax) collection and accounting in the State?			
3	Is the collection of revenues is made into accounts(s) nominated by the SBIR OR SBIR has full oversight of the accounts and is responsible for reporting and accounting for the revenues	This DLR was achieved in the 2018 APA		
4	Is the code approved by the State legislature to have a legal basis, either as a law or a resolution? It cannot be an executive order with no legal basis. The approval shall occur by the 31 December of the year under assessment to count for that year, up to 31 December 2020.	This DLR was achieved in the 2018 APA		
5	Is the Publication published online, so it is automatically available to the public/all taxpayers?	This DLR was achieved in the 2018 APA		
DLR 4.2	**Annual nominal IGR growth rate meets target**		**Achieved** Stretch target met	
1	Has the 2019-2018 annual nominal IGR growth rate met the basic or stretch targets? Basic Target: 20%-39% Stretch Target: 40% or more	a. The accounting basis used for revenue reporting in 2018 and 2019 observed from the Audited Financial statement is IPSAS accrual. b. The IVA computed the annual nominal IGR growth rate for this year APA. See the computation below:	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Findings				Conclusion	Recommendations

Item	2018 N	2019 N	GROWTH %
1. Reported IGR in AFS (Before Adjustments)	41,681,094,000	76,214,958,000	83%
3. INVALID items to be deducted IF reported as part of IGR	12,615,244,000	9,451,250,000	
Paris club refund	12,252,928,000	-	
Investment Income (e.g. dividends)	362,316,000	9,451,250,000	
3. "Adjusted IGR" for DLI 4.2 Calculation (A OR B)			
Take reported total IGR and deduct any INVALID items i.e. (1) minus (2)	29,065,850,000	66,763,708,000	130%

$$\frac{\text{₦66,763,708,000} - \text{₦29,065,850,000}}{\text{₦29,065,850,000}} \times 100$$

= 130 %

The annual nominal growth is 130%. The IVA further sought to confirm the accrued income aspect of the IGR balance for 2019 was genuine. We checked the receipts after the year end and confirmed that accrued income was received.

Source: 2019 Audited Financial Statement Pg. 51

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
DLI 5: Biometric Registration and Bank Verification Number (BVN) Used to reduce Payroll Fraud				
DLR 5.1	**Biometric capture of at least [75] percent of current civil servants and pensioners completed and linked to payroll, and identified ghost workers taken off the payroll**		**Not Achieved**	
1	Has the State used Biometrics to reduce payroll fraud through a completed biometric exercise for 75% of the current civil servants and pensioners on the State payroll?	The State has completed biometrics exercise for 52.72% of its civil servants and pensioners. This coverage is below the 75% benchmark. The IVA visited the State's Data Centre called Budget, Accounting and Treasury Management Information System (BATMIS) (for the civil servants) and the Data Centre of the Pensions Board (for the pensioners). The Systems Administrators demonstrated the processes of linking the biometric data of both the civil servants and pensioners to the payroll from their database. In the case of pensioners, Biometrics data capturing commenced in 2016; and all pensioners before 2016 have no biometrics information with the Board. From the report spooled from the database, the State as at 31st December 2019 has: Total number of civil servants on payroll - 24,858 Total number of Pensioners on payroll- 20,266 Total number of civil servants with biometrics data – 18,767. Total number of Pensioners with biometrics data – 5,025. To calculate the percentage captured:	Unsatisfactory	The State should ensure that the biometrics covers 75% of current civil servants and pensioners. The state should ensure the biometric exercise is linked to payroll.

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
		No. with biometrics x 100 Total no. of civil servants + and pensioners (18,767 + 5025) X 100 (24,858 + 20,266) 23,792 X 100 = 52.72% 45,124 The State had captured 52.72% of the State' civil servants and pensioners. Pensioners without biometrics were still being paid, pending the time the biometrics register will be fully updated		
2	Has the State linked the biometrics data to the State payroll to identify ghost workers?	The State has linked the Biometrics data to the State's payroll. A random sampling of 20 civil servants from the State's BATMIS shows that 13 out of the 20 samples representing 65% have their biometrics data linked to the payroll and evidences were obtained. In the year under assessment, the State has not identified any ghost worker.	Satisfactory	
3	Has the State removed confirmed ghost workers and ghost pensioners within three (3) months of each case being confirmed?	The State has not identified any ghost worker in respect of the civil servants. An officer in BATMIS office explained that when a civil servant dies, or leaves the system, an immediate variation order is made from the MDA and sent to the Head of Civil Service for approval. This approval is communicated to the BATMIS office where such person is removed from the nominal roll and dropped from the payroll automatically within 24 hours.	Satisfactory Albeit in the context of an incomplete biometric exercise.	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
		In the case of Pensioners, the State has introduced a periodic verification exercise called "I AM ALIVE" where pensioners revalidate their status by finger print capturing within every 90 days with designated Banks. Pensioners who fail to update within the 90 days' cycle will be suspended from the payroll. They will be reinstated after update. In the case of deceased pensioners, they are removed from payroll through:		
		1. Automatic extinction through the "I AM ALIVE" platform; 2. Pension's Board Executive Secretary's approval upon the receipt of letter of notification from the deceased family, or information from Local Government representatives. The deceased person is removed from the payroll, the month immediately following the month of approval.		
5.2	**Link BVN data to at least [75] percent of current civil servants and pensioners on the payroll and payroll fraud addressed**		**Achieved**	
1	Has the State linked the Bank Verification Number data to 75% of its current Civil Servants and pensioners on the State payroll?	a) The IVA's interview with the Director BATMIS and the ES Pensions Board showed that the State commenced BVN data capture in 2016 and completed BVN data capture of the civil servants and pensioners in 2016. b) The BVN confirmation and linking to payroll was outsourced to Nigerian Interbank Settlement System (NIBSS).	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations

	c) The IVA obtained details of Civil Servants and Pensioners BVN register which contained valid BVN as authenticated by NIBSS.
	 d) The State has a separate BVN register from biometrics register.
	 e) The IVA team reviewed the State's Payroll and BVN register and confirmed the following:
	     (i) The total civil servants' population on the State's payroll was 24,858.
	     (ii) The total payroll population with BVN data was 24,711.
	     (iii) The total population on the State Pensioners' payroll was 20,266.
	     (iv) The total pensioner's payroll population with BVN data was 20,127
	 f) The IVA obtained and reviewed the State's BVN register and payroll, along with the demonstration by the System Administrator. It was observed that the number of civil servants whose BVN have been linked to the payroll is 24,711 out of 24,858 representing 99.40% while those of the Pensioners is 20,127 out of 20,266 representing 99.53%
	 g) The IVA confirmed through an interview with the Director BATMIS and ES Pension Board that the State has no record of ghost workers and pensioners identified during the year 2019 APA as BVN is confirmed every month before payment is made.
	 h) The percentage of staff and pensioners whose BVN has been linked to the payroll is calculated as follow:
	     No. of BVN Data Linked x 100		

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
		Total No. of Civil Servants + Pensioners $\frac{(24,711 + 20,127) \times 100}{(24,858 + 20,266)}$ $\frac{44,838 \times 100}{45,124} = 99.37\%$ The State has linked 99.37 % of the State's civil servants and pensioners BVN data to the payroll.		
2	Has the State taken steps to identify payroll fraud?	The IVA confirmed that the State usually sends payroll information of both civil servants and pensioners to Nigeria Inter-Bank Settlement System (NIBSS) for verification before payment. Only accounts details returned as satisfactory are considered for payment.	Satisfactory	
DLI 6: Improved Procurement Practices for Increased Transparency and Value for Money				
DLR 6.1	**Existence of a public procurement legal framework and a procurement regulatory agency. Said legal framework should conform with the UNCITRAL Model Law and provide for: 1) e-Procurement; 2) establishment of an independent procurement regulatory agency and 3) cover all MDAs receiving funds from the State budget**		**Previously Achieved**	
1	Does the State have a public procurement legal framework which	The State met this DLR in the 2018 APA.		

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
	must be approved by the State legislature to have a legal basis, either as a law or a resolution?			
2	Does the law conform with the UNCITRAL Model Law which should provide for? 1) e-Procurement; 2) establishment of an independent procurement regulatory agency; and 3) cover all MDAs receiving funds from the State budget.	The State met this DLR in the 2018 APA.		
3	Has the State instituted an independent procurement regulatory function, which may be performed through one or a combination of the following: bureau, commission, council, agency or any other type of entity set up for the statutory purpose?	The State met this DLR in the 2018 APA.		
DLR 6.2	**Publish contract award information above a threshold set out in the Operations Manual for 2019 on a monthly basis in OCDS format on [the State website/on the online portal]**		**Achieved**	
1	Has the State achieved open contracting component of the DLI by publishing online, contract award	The IVA obtained a schedule of all contracts awarded in 2019, and confirmed that all awards above the threshold	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
	information for all contracts awarded during the fiscal year (2019) that are above the threshold (as defined in the State procurement law or in the State procurement regulation(s), in line with the Open Contracting Data Standards (OCDS).	are published on the website http://kadppa.kdsg.gov.ng/index.php/awarded-contracts/. The information published are in different documents (Some from the MDAs, LGs while others are from the procurement authority) conformed to the OCDS format.		
DLI 7: Strengthened Public Debt Management and Fiscal Responsibility Framework				
DLR 7.1	**State implementing state-level debt legislation, which stipulates: 1) responsibilities for contracting state debt; 2) responsibilities for recording/reporting state debt; and 3) fiscal and debt rules/limits.**		**Previously Achieved**	
1	Is there an Approved state-level public debt legislation through the passage of a State Fiscal Responsibility Law, OR the passage of the State Public Debt Management Law, OR the inclusion of the provisions of the Fiscal Responsibility Act (FRA) in the organic PFM Law?	The State met this DLR in the 2018 APA.		
2	Does the legislation include provisions which establish the following?	The State met this DLR in the 2018 APA.		

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
	1) Responsibilities for contracting state debt; 2) Responsibilities for recording/reporting state debt; and 3) Fiscal and debt rules/limits for the state.			
4	Has the State Debt Management Department (or Unit, Committee, Agency, Board, Bureau, Commission, Council) has been operational during the APA year and performing the core function of recording and reporting state debt.	The State met this DLR in the 2018 APA.		
DLR 7.2	**Quarterly State debt reports accepted by the DMO on average two months or less after the end of the quarters in 2019**		**Achieved**	
1	Has the State produced quarterly State Domestic Debt Reports (SDDR), which are approved by the DMO on average of two months after the end of the quarter in 2019?	The State has produced quarterly State Domestic Reports (SDDR), which are approved by the DMO on average of two months after the end of each quarter in 2019. The 2019 SDDR were submitted and acknowledged by DMO on the following dates: Q1 submitted on 15/5/19 - 6.4 weeks (45 days) Q2 submitted on 9/8/19 -5.7 weeks (40 days) Q3 submitted on 28/11/19 -8.4 (59 days) Q4 submitted on 7/2/20 - 5.4 weeks (38 days) The SDDRs were submitted within an average of 6.5 weeks (45.5 days)	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
2	**Note: Have you reviewed for accuracy and completeness from the DMO:** The State Domestic and External Debt Report (SDEDR) along with all underlying data and supporting documents including the DMO templates and guidelines and standard internal protocols and data from CBN, DMO and FMOF Home Finance used by the DMO to cross-check the state's domestic debt figures.	The IVA team reviewed the DMO's Report on State Domestic and External Debt Report (SDEDR) with the Kaduna State Debt Domestic Report. The DMO's report has a balance of ₦253,242,449,808 while the State's SDDR's balance is ₦ 248,661,873,247.26. This shows a difference of ₦ 4,580,576,560.96. The report was supported with the DMO's templates and guidelines. Also, the team reviewed the DMO report and confirmed the accuracy and completeness of the State Domestic Debt Report. The review of the reports shows that the State had understated her Budget Support Facility by ₦3,551,038,315.45. A wider review was undertaken of the information and supporting schedules submitted by the DMO, and several clarifications and adjustments were made to correct errors and omissions in the state's submission to the DMO. Conclusions reached in this report are based on the amended DMO data.	N/A	State should submit accurate quarterly state domestic report
DLI 8: Improved Clearance/Reduction of Stock of Domestic Expenditure Arrears				
DLR 8.0	**Domestic arrears as of end 2019 reported in an online publicly accessible database, with a verification process in place and an arrears clearance framework established.** **AND**	The State did not submit to the IVA the annual state arrears recording, verification, and clearance report (SARVCR)	**Not Achieved**	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
	Percentage decline in the verified stock of domestic arrears at end 2019 compared to end 2018 meets target and is consistent with the state's arrears clearance framework. -**Basic target:** At least a 5% decline or maintain stock below N5 billion -**Stretch target:** More than 20% decline			
1	Has the State established an Arrears Clearance Framework (ACF)?	The State has not established the Arrears Clearance Framework (ACF) as at 31st Dec, 2019 but the ACF was established on 8th January, 2020. The link to the ACF is https://finance.kdsg.gov.ng/arrears-clearance-framework-2019/ The State has also published a multi-year funding plan on the 22nd September, 2020 with link as follows: https://finance.kdsg.gov.ng/download/kdsg-multi-year-funding-plan-for-arrears-clearance/	Unsatisfactory	The State should establish an Arrears Clearance Framework (ACF)
2	Does the ACF contain: 1) the planned actions to settle arrears; and 2) an explicit prioritization of expenditure arrears to be settled.	The State has not established the Arrears Clearance Framework (ACF) as at 31st Dec, 2019.	Unsatisfactory	The ACF should contain: 1) Planned actions to settle arrears 2) An explicit prioritization of expenditure arrears to be settled

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
3	Has the ACF been published on a State official website?	The State has not established the Arrears Clearance Framework (ACF) as at 31st Dec, 2019.	Unsatisfactory	The State should ensure that the ACF is published on its Official website
4.	Is the clearance of domestic expenditure arrears consistent with the ACF, once the ACF has been established?	The State has not established the Arrears Clearance Framework (ACF) as at 31st Dec, 2019.	Unsatisfactory	The State should ensure that the clearance of domestic expenditure arrears is consistent with the ACF
5.	Has the State established an Internal Domestic Arrears Database?	The State has not established an Internal Domestic Arrears Database as at 31st Dec, 2019.	Unsatisfactory	a) The State should ensure that they establish an internal domestic arrears database. b) The Internal Domestic Arrears Database should include aggregate and individual amounts of contractors' arrears; aggregate amount of pension and gratuity arrears; aggregate amount of salary arrears and other staff claims
6	Has the State published online elements of the internal domestic	The State has not established an Internal Domestic Arrears Database as at 31st Dec, 2019.	Unsatisfactory	The State should ensure that they

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings				Conclusion	Recommendations
	arrears database for the FY **2018** and FY **2019** reported on a State official website, which constitutes the online publicly accessible arrears database?						publish online, elements of the Internal domestic arrears database.
7. New	Does the online publication include? 1) the aggregate amount of contractors' arrears; 2) the aggregate amount of pension and gratuity arrears; 3) the aggregate amount of salary arrears and other staff claims; 4) other types of domestic arrears and 5) a list of names of contractors with recognized arrears exceeding N20million and information for contractors to be able to verify that their claims are being accurately reported in the database.	The State has not established an Internal Domestic Arrears Database as at 31st Dec, 2019.				Unsatisfactory	a) The State should ensure that they publish online lists of contractors with recognised arrears exceeding N20million. b) The state should ensure that contractors are able to verify that their claims are accurately reported
New	Has the State met the following: (ii) Percentage decline in the verified stock of domestic arrears at end 2019 compared to end 2018 meets target and is consistent with the state's arrears clearance framework.	**Aggregate Amount of:**	**2019 N**	**2018 N**		Satisfactory	
		Contractors Arrears	16,389,982,023.56	30,202,630,124.29			
		Pension and Gratuity arrears	23,174,258,554.56	21,195,799,628.68			
		Salary arrears and Staff claims	-				
		Other types of domestic	-				

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
-**Basic target:** At least a 5% year-on-year decline or maintain stock or arrears below N5billion. -**Stretch target:** More than 20% year-on-year decline. The clearance/reduction of domestic expenditure arrears (contractors, pension and gratuity arrears, salary arrears and other staff claims) is defined as the decline in the nominal stock of total domestic expenditure arrears at the end of year, compared to the previous year, expressed in percentage terms.	<table><tr><td>expenditure arrears</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>**Total Domestic Arrears**</td><td>39,564,240,578.12</td><td>51,398,429,752.97</td></tr></table> a. The IVA team obtained the Domestic arrears figure from the State Internal Domestic Arrears (SIDA) database and confirmed that the State has achieved 23.02% decline in the clearance of verified domestic arrears as at the end of 2019. The decline is computed as follows: $$\frac{2018\ Figure - 2019\ Figure}{2018\ Figure} \times 100$$ $$\frac{51,398,429,752.97 - 39,564,240,578.12}{51,398,429,752.97} \times 100$$ $$\frac{-11,834,189,174.85}{51,398,429,752.97} \times 100$$ =23.02% decline. **Source**: State internal domestic expenditure arrears database		

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
DLI 9: Improved Debt Sustainability				
DLR 9.0	**Average monthly debt service deduction is < 40% of gross FAAC allocation for FY [2019]** **AND** **Total debt stock at end Dec [2019] as a share of total revenue for FY [2019] meets target:** **-Basic target: < [140%]** **-Stretch target: < [115%]**		**Not Achieved**	
	Has the State met: (i) the ratio of total monthly debt service (principal and interest) deductions from FAAC allocation during the calendar year of the year of assessment (1st January to 31st December 2019) to the gross FAAC allocation for the same calendar year? **Less than :< [40%]**	The IVA computed the percentage of total monthly debt service deductions/Gross FAAC Allocation for year 2019 APA and found it was 8% as shown below Total Debt Service Deduction N5,845,600,959 x100 Gross FAAC N73,486,906,888 = 8% **Source:** FMoF (FAAC)	Satisfactory	
	Has the State met: (ii) the ratio of total debt stock at end-of-year (31st December 2019) of the year of assessment to the total revenue collected during the calendar year of the year of assessment (1st January to 31st December 2019)?	The following tables show the calculations and adjustments made to arrive at the appropriate figures for this comparison. **Total Public Debt** 		Financial Statements	DMO figures (Adj)		Unsatisfactory	The State should reduce its debt to revenue ratio to levels that will enable the achievement of this DLR.

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Findings		Conclusion	Recommendations
-Basic target:< [140%] **-Stretch target:** < [115%]	Total Domestic Debts	189,590,430,000 **83,479,187,717**		

Total Domestic Debts	189,590,430,000	**83,479,187,717**
Total External Debts	162,246,615,000	**169,763,262,092**
Total Public Debts	351,837,046,000	**253,242,449,808**

Total annual revenue

2019 Adjusted IGR (see DLI 4.2)	66,763,708,000
Gross FAAC Allocation	73,486,906,888
Grants	13,495,192,000
Other Revenues	9,451,250,000
Total Revenue**	163,197,056,888

The IVA team have computed the total debts stock / revenue percentage for the 2019 year, as follows:

$$\frac{\text{Total Public Debts*}}{\text{Total Revenue}} \times 100$$

$$\frac{253,242,449,808}{163,197,056,888} \times 100$$
$$\underline{155.18\%}$$

Sources: For Total Revenue: 2019 Audited Financial Statement, Pg 13.
*Table 3 below holds a breakdown of the Total Debt.
**Table 3(ii) holds the breakdown of Revenue

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Findings	Conclusion	Recommendations
		a. The debt stock stated in the Federal DMO State Domestic is lower by N98,594,596,192 than External Debt Report debt stock stated in the audited financial statement. This represents a 39% difference. b. The State acknowledged the difference in external debt of N6,961,865,000 in the 2019 Financial Statements in Note 34f, Page 74 with the intention to adjust to the DMO reconciled figure in 2020 Financial Statements. c. The difference has been communicated to the State for explanation. d. The SDEDR has not been amended and resubmitted to the IVA along with explanations for any changes.		

TABLE 3: DLI 9 31 DECEMBER 2019 STATE DEBT STOCK TABLE FOR KADUNA STATE

KADUNA STATE	AMOUNT (₦)
BUDGET SUPPORT LOAN (SOURCE FMOF)	21,081,217,713
BAIL OUT (SALARIES) (SOURCE CBN)	12,809,745,880
RESTRUCTURED COMMERCIAL BANK LOANS (FGN BOND)	-
EXCESS CRUDE ACCOUNT BACKED LOAN (SOURCE CBN)	9,023,983,546
STATE BONDS	-
COMMERCIAL BANK LOANS	-
CBN COMMERCIAL AGRIC LOAN (SOURCE CBN)	-
INFRASTRUCTURE LOAN (CBN FACILITY)	-
MICRO SMALL MEDIUM ENTERPRISES DEVELOPMENT FUND (MSMEDF) SOURCE CBN)	1,000,000,000
JUDGEMENT DEBTS	-
GOVT - GOVT DEBTS	-
CONTRACTORS' ARREARS	16,389,982,024
PENSION AND GRATUITY ARREARS	23,174,258,555
SALARY ARREARS AND OTHER CLAIMS	-
OTHER DEBTS	-
TOTAL DOMESTIC DEBT (TDD)	**83,479,187,717**
TOTAL EXTERNAL DEBT (TED)	**169,763,262,092**
TOTAL PUBLIC DEBT (TED+TDD)	**253,242,449,808**

TABLE 3(ii): DLI 9 31 DECEMBER 2019 - ADJUSTED REVENUE TABLE FOR KADUNA STATE

	NGN
Item	**2019**
1. Total Gross FAAC allocation: Statutory Transfers and VAT (1.1 + 1.2)	**73,486,906,888**
1.1 Statutory transfers (1.1.1 + 1.1.2 + 1.1.3)	**56,620,487,961**
1.1.1 Gross statutory allocation	54,233,604,865
1.1.2 Derivation	
1.1.3 Other FAAC transfers (also known as Distribution) such excess PPT savings account, Forex equalization, excess bank charges, exchange rate gain, augmentation, others	2,386,883,096
1.2 VAT	**16,866,418,927**
2. Internally Generated Revenues (IGR) - Adjusted	**66,763,708,000**
3. Grants (internal and external)	**13,495,192,000**
4A. Other revenues (4.1 + 4.2 + 4.3)	**9,451,250,000**
4.1 Investment Income (e.g. dividends)	9,451,250,000
4.2 Interest Earned	
4.3 Miscellaneous	
Total Revenues and Grants Calculations	
A) Total Revenues and Grants is (1+2+3+4A)	**163,197,056,888**

4. Response from the State

The State should please use the table below for their response.

S/N	State Response to the draft report	IVA Follow-up, response, treatment
1	We are appealing for the consideration of Revised 2019 Budget for the assessment of DLI 1.2 given the justification provided. The approved Revised figure was N**239,131,446,105.36** and the actual expenditure was **N232,579,908,000.00.** Consequently**,** the 2019 Budget deviation considering the Approved Revised Budget was **2.74%.** Find attached 2020 Approved Budget for the 2019 Approved Revised figure.	The IVA is unable to accommodate requests outside the guidelines in the SFTAS Verification Protocol.
2	**DLR 7.2.2** 1. Kaduna State Government did not understate its Budget Support Facility (BSF) by N3,551,038,315.45. Kindly re-visit the explanations provided earlier. Attached also is the Amortization Schedule from the FMOF on the State's BSF. **Note** that the state often sends a soft copy of the draft report to the DMO for vetting before signing off. The IVA stated that "conclusions reached in this report are based on the amended DMO data". Hitherto, the DMO had not communicated to the state that we have issues, if any, with our records.	The IVA applied adjusted and corrected debt figures balances provided by the FMOFB&NP, CBN and DMO. No other revised figures were received. We suggest this matter is taken up directly with the three listed entities
3	**DLR 9.0** The computation of debt stock at the end of December 2019 as a share of total revenue for 2019 could not meet neither the Basic nor Stretch target. The State has taken all strategies to improve in the subsequent assessment	This is noted.

REPORT ON THE ACHIEVEMENT OF THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR THE 2019 PERFORMANCE YEAR

YOUR STATE HAS BEEN ASSESSED AS HAVING MET THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR THE 2019 PERFORMANCE YEAR.

This report sets out the assessed performance of the State against the set eligibility criteria for the States' Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability Programme (SFTAS). It contains feedback and clarifications to enable the State prepare better for the next assessment. Note that the eligibility assessment will be conducted afresh on an annual basis and being deemed eligible in one year does not guarantee eligibility in subsequent years. Please visit the SFTAS guidelines for more detail on eligibility.

Any enquiries on the contents of this report should be routed through the State Focal persons to the following email address – sftas@oaugf.ng

Eligibility Criteria 2019 Part I - The online publication of Approved Budgets for 2020 by 31st January 2020

Information Source(s)	Initial checks	Initial Comments / Observations	Follow up	Final Assessment
https://kdsg.gov.ng/3216-2/?wpdmc=budget	A search was done on the Kaduna State website	The 2020 Budget was published on the State Official website, a copy was downloaded.	A request was made on 09/01/2020 to the focal persons to provide evidence of the Governor's assent	**EC met** There was no response from the focal persons however, a further search was done, and evidence of Governor's assent was seen published.

Tests/checks performed	Results	Areas for improvement
Is the approved budget for 2020 available on any of the State Government Websites?	Yes	None
Was the approved budget published online before 31 January 2020?	Yes	None
Is the published budget clear and legible?	Yes	None
Can the budget be downloaded?	Yes	None
Do we have evidence of assent by the Governor?	Yes	None

Eligibility Criteria 2019 Part 2 - The online publication of Audited Financial Statements for FY2018 by 30th September 2019

Source(s)	Initial Work Done	Initial Comments / Observation	Follow up	Final Assessment
http://www.pbc.kadgov.ng	A search was done on the Kaduna State Website and the Audited Financial Statements were downloaded.	The Audited Financial Statements were easily accessed and downloaded.	N/A	EC met

Tests/checks performed	Results	Areas for improvement
Were the Financial Statements (FS) for 2018 available on any of the State Government Websites? (and were the FS straightforward or difficult to find?)	Yes	None
Were the Financial Statement for 2018 available published online before 30th September 2019?	Yes	None
Are the published financial statements clear and legible?	Yes	None
Can the Financial Statements be downloaded?	Yes	None
Do we have evidence of audit by the State Auditor-General?	Yes	None
Are the financial statements complete, including primary statements and disclosure notes?	Yes	None
Are there any indications that balances within the financial statements are not credible	n/a	Please see the 2018 APA Report