

# The States' Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability (SFTAS) Program for Results

### 2019 Annual Performance Assessment (APA) Report

### **KOGI STATE**

By:

The Office of the Auditor General for the Federation as the SFTAS Independent Verification Agent with support from JK Consulting Co. Ltd



November 2020

## **Table of Contents**

1.	Executive summary	3
	Introduction	
	2.1 Overview	5
	2.2 Scope	5
3.	Assessment Results	6
	3.1 Findings	6
4.	Response from the State	33
Δnr	pendix A - Report on the achievement of the Fligibility Criteria for 2019	. 34

### 1 Executive Summary

This report details the outcome of the Annual Performance Assessment (APA) conducted on Kogi State for the second (2019) year of the four-year SFTAS Program. In conducting the APA, the verification team assessed how the State performed against the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) listed within the SFTAS DLI Matrix, guidelines and verification protocol.

**Table 1** (below) reflects the outcome of the 2019 APA for Kogi State and shows areas where the State achieved results. In total, Kogi State achieved **12 (Twelve)** DLRs out of 15 DLRs applicable to 2019 while 3 DLRs were achieved in 2018.

**Table 1: Assessment Results** 

Key:	Achieved		Not Achieved		Previously Achieved	
------	----------	--	--------------	--	---------------------	--

Disbursement Linked Indicators	Disbursement Linked Results	Results	Remarks
<b>DLI 1:</b> Improved financial reporting and budget reliability	DLR 1.1: FY19 quarterly budget implementation reports published on average within 6 weeks of quarter-end to enable timely budget management		The Reports were published online on average of 5.1 weeks.
	DLR 1.2: FY19 deviation for total budget expenditure is < 25%		The expenditure outturn deviation was 16%.
<b>DLI 2:</b> Increased openness and citizens' engagement in the	DLR 2.1: Citizens' inputs from formal public consultations are published online, along with the proposed FY2020 budget.		Public consultation was published online on 10 <sup>th</sup> and 11 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2019.
budget process	DLR 2.2: Citizens' budget based on approved FY19 State budget published online by end April 2019.		Citizens' budget based on approved FY19 State budget was published on 29th April, 2019.
DLI 3: Improved cash management and reduced revenue leakages through implementation of State TSA	DLR 3: TSA, based on a formally approved cash management strategy, established and functional, and covering a minimum of 60 percent of state government finances implementation of State TSA.		The TSA covered 74% of State Government finances.
<b>DLI 4:</b> Strengthened Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) collection	DLR 4.1: State implementing a consolidated state revenue code covering all state IGR sources and stipulating that the state bureau of internal revenue is the sole agency responsible for state revenue collection and accounting. Code must be approved by the state legislature and published		Previously Achieved in 2018 APA
	DLR 4.2: 2019-2018 annual nominal IGR growth rate meets target: -Basic target: 20%-39%, Stretch target: 40% or more.	Stretch target achieved	IGR Nominal Growth Rate was 52%.
<b>DLI 5:</b> Biometric registration and Bank Verification Number (BVN) used to reduce	DLR 5.1: Biometric capture of at least 75 percent of current civil servants and pensioners completed and linked to payroll, and identified ghost workers taken off the payroll		Biometric capture of 96.6% of civil servants are linked to the payroll.
payroll fraud	DLR 5.2: Link BVN data to at least 75 percent of current civil servants and pensioners on the payroll and payroll fraud addressed.		100% of civil servant's payroll are linked to BVN.

Disbursement Linked	Disbursement Linked Results	Results	Remarks
Indicators			
ptl 6: Improved procurement practices for increased transparency and value for money	DLR 6.1: Existence of public procurement legal framework and procurement regulatory agency. Said legal framework should conform with the UNCITRAL Model Law and provide for: 1) E-Procurement; 2) Establishment of an independent procurement regulatory agency; and 3) Cover all MDAs receiving funds from the state budget.		Previously Achieved in 2018 APA
	DLR 6.2: Publish contract award information above a threshold set out in the Operations Manual for 2019 on a monthly basis in OCDS format on the state website.		Contracts are published in OCDS format on the state website
public debt management and fiscal responsibility framework	DLR 7.1: State implementing state-level debt legislation, which stipulates: 1) responsibilities for contracting state debt; 2) responsibilities for recording/reporting state debt; and 3) fiscal and debt rules/limits.		Previously Achieved in 2018 APA
	DLR 7.2: Quarterly state debt reports accepted by the DMO on average two months or less after the end of the quarter in 2019		Quarterly State debt reports were submitted before due date.
DLI 8: Improved clearance/reduction of stock of domestic expenditure arrears	DLR 8: Domestic arrears as of end 2019 reported in an online publicly accessible database, with a verification process in place and an arrears clearance framework established <b>and</b> Percentage decline in the verified stock of domestic arrears at end 2019 compared to end 2018 meets target and is consistent with the state's arrears clearance framework.	Stretch Target achieved	Total arrears were N836m, i.e. less than the N5bn limit set for this DLR. The State also achieved a 91.85% reduction in arrears.
<b>DLI 9:</b> Improved debt sustainability	Total debt stock at end of December 2019 as a share of total revenue for FY2019 meets target: Basic target: < 140%, Stretch target: < 115% and Average monthly debt service deduction is < 40% of gross FAAC allocation for FY2019.	Basic target achieved	Monthly debt service deduction is 12.8% of Gross FAAC, and the Total Debt Stock to Revenue is 137.9%.

The Office of the Auditor-General for the Federation as Independent Verification Agent and JK Consulting Co. Ltd agree on all the results shown in this report.

#### 2. Introduction

#### 2.1 Overview

The Federal Government of Nigeria is implementing a four-year program to support Nigerian States to strengthen fiscal performance and sustainability: The State Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability (SFTAS) Program for Results ("The Program"). In each of the four years, the Program will finance activities under two components: (i) a Program for Results (PforR) component in the amount of US\$700 million and (ii) a Technical Assistance (TA) component in the amount of US\$50 million. All States are able to participate in the Program in each of the four years and benefit from the PforR funds by meeting set Eligibility Criteria and any or all the indicators of fiscal transparency, accountability and sustainability.

The Auditor-General for the Federation was appointed as the Independent Verification Agent (IVA) for the SFTAS Programme and JK Consulting Co. Ltd was subsequently engaged to support the IVA. Both parties have worked together to assess the performance of the State against the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) for 2019. To ensure a high-quality assessment, the IVA engaged the services of experts in Taxation, Procurement and Debt Management laws to review the legislation in place for each State.

#### 2.2 Scope

This Annual Performance Assessment (APA) Report covers the State's performance in 2019 against the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) listed within the SFTAS DLI Matrix, guidelines and verification protocol. Each State was earlier assessed against the Eligibility Criteria set in the protocol, to determine the state's eligibility for grants under the 2019 APA. The results of the eligibility assessment were reported previously to each state, and are included in Appendix A.

The verification protocol was set early in the preparation for the Program and all States, implementing agencies and other key stakeholders have been continuously sensitised on the requirements of the program and on the protocol for 2019. The assessment results are binary (Pass or Fail), as that is how the Program for Results was designed.

In advance of the performance assessments, all States were provided with the detailed information requirements for the assessments, a proposed itinerary for the assessment visit and a template with which to report the results achieved. The assessments were conducted between (24/08/2020 and 28/08/2020) with a team of 4 persons, starting with an opening meeting where all the information requested were handed over. The visit was concluded with an exit meeting where the initial findings were discussed, and each state was given a further opportunity to provide clarifications and/additional information.

The draft conclusions from the work done were reported to the State and this final report takes account of the State's comments on the draft results, as shown in Section 4.

The Office of the Auditor-General for the Federation and JK Consulting Co. Ltd are grateful to the States for the cooperation enjoyed during the assessment and hope the recommendations within this Report are found valuable towards achieving the DLRs in the remaining years of the Program.

## 3. Assessment Results

### 3.1 Findings

Table 2: Findings

Disbu	rsement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Findings	Conclusion	Recommendati ons
	Improved Financial Reporting and eting Reliability			
DLR 1.1	Financial Year [2019] quarterly budget implementation reports published on average within [6 weeks] of each quarter-end to enable timely budget management		Achieved	
1	Has the State published its quarterly budget implementation report to the State official website on average within six weeks of the end of each quarter?	The quarterly budget implementation reports were posted online on (https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/budget-performance//) as follows:  • (a) Q1 – (03/05/2019)- 33 days, 4.7weeks • (b) Q2 – (07/08/2019) - 38 days, 5.4 weeks • (c) Q3 – (08/11/2019) - 42 days, 6.0 weeks • (d) Q4 – (30/01/2020- 30 days, 4.3weeks • Average weeks for the online publication are computed as below:  33+38+42+30 4  Average = 5.1 Weeks (35.8 days)	Satisfactory	
		The team downloaded the quarterly budget implementation reports for all four quarters of the year 2019 and obtained evidence of a time stamp of the publications.		

2	Do the reports each include, at a minimum, the approved original AND revised (if applicable) budget appropriation for the year against each organizational units (MDAs) for each of the core economic classification of expenditures (Personnel, Overheads, Capital, and others), the actual expenditures for the quarter attributed to each as well as the cumulative expenditures for year to date, and balances against each of the revenue and expenditure appropriations.	From the review of the Quarterly Budget Implementation reports downloaded from the State's website (see weblinks above), the team observed the following;  a. The Budget Implementation Reports include the approved budget appropriation for the year against each organizational unit (MDAs) for each of the core economic classification of expenditures.  b. The Budget Implementation Reports include the actual expenditures for the quarter attributed to each as well as the cumulative expenditures for year to date.  c. The Budget Implementation Reports include the balances against each of the revenue and expenditure appropriations.  d. The State has revised its budget but the Budget Implementation Reports do not show the approved revised budget.  The reports include the approved budget appropriation for the year for each of the core economic classification of expenditures (Personnel, Overheads, Capital, and others); the actual expenditures for the quarter and the balances against each of the	Satisfactory	
3	Does the report State the actual expenditures for the quarter attributed to each MDA and each expenditure classification as well as the cumulative expenditures for year to date?	revenue and expenditure appropriations.  Upon review of the State's Budget Performance reports, they state the actual expenditures for each quarter attributed to each MDA and each expenditure classification as well as the cumulative expenditures for the year to date.	Satisfactory	
4	Does the report State balances against each of the revenue and expenditure appropriations with balances provided on a consolidated basis across the four (4) expenditure classifications and 'Other Expenditures' which will include debt servicing, and transfers, or other expenditures not attributable to any of	Upon further review of the State's Budget Performance reports, they state the balances against each of the revenue and expenditure appropriations with balances provided on a consolidated basis across the four (4) expenditure classifications.	Satisfactory	

	the other three (3) expenditure classifications?						
DLR	FY [2019] deviation from total budget					Achieved	
1.2	expenditure is less than 25%						
1	Has the State computed the difference between the original approved total	The Sta	te computed	the budget deviatio	n for 2019 to be 15.93%.		
	budgeted expenditure for the fiscal/calendar year and the actual total		computed tl	-	for this APA year. See	Satisfactory	
	budgeted expenditure in the fiscal/calendar year, divided by the	_					
	original approved total budgeted			Original Budget	Actual Outturn		
	expenditure, and expressed in positive		Capital	75,109,591,418	28,589,764,955		
	percentage terms?	F	Rec. Exp	71,626,451,092	94,638,548,494		
		7	Total	146,736,042,510	123,228,313,449		
	Is the expenditure outturn deviation computed less than 25%?		₩146,736	,042,510 – <del>№</del> 123,228	<del>_</del>		
		<del>¥</del> 146,736,042,510					
		The bud	dget perform	ance deviation is 16.	02%		
		Source:	: 2019 Audite	d Financial Statemer	nt Pg 10 for cashflow		
		statement and Approved Budget and Actual Expenditure or					
		Approp	riation Law				
					the result above and we		
				•	y and Equipment (Non-		
			•		1,806,839,290, having		
]			•	75,484,893 from the			
				-	explained in the AFS by nt of Financial Position		
			_		tated to be Biological		
			-	f the biological asset	•		
				_	of this report, but does		
				ision for this DLR.	, ,		
	Increased Openness and Citizens' Engagem Budget Process						
3110							

DLR 2.1	Citizens' inputs from formal public consultations are published online, along with the proposed FY [2020] budget		Achieved
1	Did the State conduct at least one "town-hall" consultation before the proposed budget is drafted with participation of local government authorities and State-based CSOs?	<ul> <li>The State held 3 consultations and the details are provided below:</li> <li>a. The attendees from the LGAs that were in attendance: Lokoja LGA, Kaba/Bunu LGA, Ankpa LGA, Mopa-Muro LGA, Basa LGA, Okene LGA, Okehi LGA.</li> <li>b. The representatives of the CSOs that were in attendance: Search for Common Ground, Initiative for Grassroots Advancement and Representative of the Community.</li> <li>c. The sources of information from which the conclusions were drawn are minutes of the consultations, attendance, and pictures.</li> <li>d. Three consultation meetings were held, the dates and venues are: <ol> <li>i. Stakeholders Townhall Meeting on Year 2020 Budget held on 2nd Oct 2019 at Kafas Multipurpose Event Centre, Phase II, Lokoja.</li> <li>ii. Stakeholders Townhall Meeting on Year 2020 Budget held on 5th Nov 2019 at Igbo Hall, Dada Onikar Junction, Kabba.</li> <li>iii. Stakeholders Townhall Meeting on Year 2020 Budget held on 6th Nov, 2019 at The Undergraduate Auditorium, FCE, Okene.</li> <li>e. 10 attendees were called to confirm their attendance at the public consultations and their responses were satisfactory.</li> <li>f. The Proposed budget was drafted on 4<sup>th</sup> November 2019.</li> <li>g. The consultation was done before the proposed budget was drafted.</li> </ol> </li></ul>	Satisfactory
2	Were the minutes of the public consultations jointly prepared with CSO representatives (shown by their signature to the minutes) and posted on the official State website, alongside the	a. The representatives of the CSOs that were in attendance: Search for Common Ground, Initiative for Grassroots Advancement and Representative of Community co-signed the minutes.	Satisfactory

	proposed annual budget on or before 31	b.	The weblinks of both attendance and minutes are below:		
	January 2020 to enable citizens to find		i. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-		
	the inputs easily?		content/uploads/SIGNED-MINUTES-OF-BUDGET-2020-		
			STAKEHOLDERS-MEETING-IN-LOKOJA-1-1.pdf		
			ii. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-		
			content/uploads/ATTENDANCE-LIST-FOR-BUDGET2020-		
			STAKEHOLDERS-MEETING-IN-LOKOJA-1.pdf		
			iii. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/2020-		
			BUDGET-STAKEHOLDERS-MEETING-IN-LOKOJA-IN-PIX.mp4		
			iv. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-		
			content/uploads/ATTENDANCE-LIST-FOR-BUDGET-2020-		
			STAKEHOLDERS-MEETING-IN-OKENE-1.pdf		
			v. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-		
			content/uploads/SIGNED-MINUTES-OF-BUDGET-2020-		
			STAKEHOLDERS-MEETING-IN-OKENE-3.pdf		
			vi. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/2020-		
			STAKEHOLDERS-MEETING-IN-OKENE-PIX.mp4		
			vii. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-		
			content/uploads/ATTENDANCE-LIST-FOR-BUDGET-2020-		
			STAKEHOLDERS-MEETING-IN-KABBA-1.pdf		
			viii. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-		
			content/uploads/ATTENDANCE-LIST-FOR-BUDGET-2020-		
			STAKEHOLDERS-MEETING-IN-KABBA-1.pdf		
			ix. https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/2020-stakeholders-		
			meeting-in-kabba/		
		c.	The consultations were published online on 10 <sup>th</sup> and 11 <sup>th</sup>		
			November while the proposed budget was published on 4 <sup>th</sup>		
			November 2019 before the deadline of 31 <sup>st</sup> January 2020.		
		d.	See Appendix A for weblinks to the proposed/final budget		
LR	Citizens' budget based on approved			Achieved	
2.2	FY19 State budget published online by				
	end April 2019.				
ew					

1 New	Has the State published online, on the State website(s) a Citizens Budget based on the approved FY19 state budget not later than 30 April 2019?	The Citizens budget based on approved FY19 state budget was published on 29 <sup>th</sup> April 2019 before the due date on (https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/budget-of-consolidation.pdf, https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/citizens-budget-2020.pdf) accessed on (14/08/2020).	Satisfactory
2 New	Is the Citizens Budget a comprehensible (to citizens) summary of the approved FY19 state budget?	The team confirmed that the Citizens budget summarizes in a comprehensible manner to citizens of the approved FY19 state budget and it was prepared in the format suggested to the State. It accurately includes the key budget information from the original budget. This as follows:	Satisfactory
		<ul> <li>i. A simple explanation of the annual budget/citizen's budget; see Pg. 4</li> <li>ii. Breakdown of revenues and expenditures pgs. 9-10 and 16-19</li> <li>iii. Disclosure of Budget deficit and how it will be financed. Pgs. 11-15</li> <li>iv. Sectoral Allocation (MDAs by MDAs), pgs. 18 &amp; 19</li> <li>v. Top Projects to be financed (at least 5), pgs. 20-22</li> </ul>	
DLI 3:	Improved Cash Management and reduced		
Leakag	ges through Implementation of State TSA		
DLR	Improved cash management and		Achieved
3.0	reduced revenue leakages through implementation of State TSA		

1	Has the State established a functional State-level TSA?	The State maintained a TSA with Zenith Bank Account Number 1014558813 from 01/01/2019 to 10/05/2019 for FAAC allocations and transferred to UBA Bank Account Number 1020895797 (10/05/2019-31/12/2019).  A lead IGR account was also maintained with Access Bank account number 0710013288.  Revenue collections through several bank accounts are swept into IGR lead account twice monthly. Funds were transferred from the IGR lead account to the TSA daily. Expenditures were also made directly from the TSA.  The State operates multiple accounts.  • Statutory Revenue (FAAC)	Satisfactory	
		<ul> <li>Statutory Revenue (FAAC) Bank Name: (Old TSA) Zenith Bank Plc (1/1/2019-10/5/2019) Account Number: 1014558813 Bank Name: (New TSA) UBA Plc (10/5/2019-31/12/2019) Account Number: 1020895797</li> <li>Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) Bank Name: Access Bank Account Number: 0710013288</li> <li>VAT Bank Name: UBA Bank Account Number: 1020895838</li> </ul>		
2	Is there a formally approved cash management strategy in place? The Strategy should cover the processes through which the State Ministry of Finance or Budgets/Economic Planning is able to forecast cash commitments and requirements and provide reliable information on the availability of funds.	<ul> <li>a. The title of the cash management strategy is "Guidelines for the operation of Treasury Single Account (TSA) and Cash Management Strategy".</li> <li>b. It was produced on the 9th February 2017 and assented by the Governor of Kogi State.</li> <li>c. The strategy includes the processes through which the State Ministry of Finance or Budgets/Economic Planning can forecast cash commitments and requirements and provide reliable information on the availability of funds as stated in</li> </ul>	Satisfactory	

		Page11 (Structure & Operational Guidelines for TSA Implementation).  d. The State conducts daily cash sweeping as stated in the cash management strategy.  e. There is evidence of implementation of processes described in the cash management strategy to forecast cash commitments and requirements and provide reliable information on the availability of funds.	
3	Does the TSA have a system of cash management that allows for a central view of cash balances in bank accounts on a single electronic dashboard (based on the approved cash management strategy)?	The State has a computer application (Dashboard) where the State can view the cash balances in the bank accounts.  a. The name of the computer application is UBA Internet Banking, UBA Plc  b. The app is approved for use by the cash management strategy.  c. The App was deployed in May 2019.	Satisfactory
4	Does the TSA have one consolidated revenue treasury account for State revenues? Revenues collected by MDAs such as service fees no longer sit in individual MDA accounts at different commercial banks but are brought into the consolidated revenue account as part of the TSA.	<ul> <li>a. Kogi State TSA was held at (Old TSA) Zenith Bank Plc, Account Number: 1014558813 as at (1/1/2019-10/5/2019) and (New TSA) UBA Plc, Account Number: 1020895797 (10/5/2019-31/12/2019) which is their Statutory Revenue (FAAC) account.</li> <li>b. All government monies go through this account (New TSA account in UBA bank)</li> <li>c. All government monies do not sit in the other revenue collecting banks.</li> <li>d. The TSA bank Statement obtained is from the period stated below: <ol> <li>i. Zenith Bank Statement (01/01/2019 – 10/05/2019)</li> <li>ii. UBA Bank Statement (10/05/2019-31/12/2019)</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	Satisfactory
5	Does the TSA cover a minimum of 60% of the State Government's finances?	The IVA computed the total cash inflow and outflow from the TSA account against the total government finances inflows and outflows as contained in the Cashflow Statement for the year ended 2019.  See the computation below:	Satisfactory

			Total Inflows	Total Outflows			
		TSA Bank	80,853,942,302.15	85,197,480,945.65			
		Statement	00,033,342,302.13	03,137,700,343.03			
		Government	104,198,403, 475	123,228,313,449			
		Finances*		,			
		Percentage	78%	69%			
		_					
		The average is	percentage compu				
				<u>· 69 %</u> 2			
			= <b>7</b> 3				
		The TSA cover	ور – ed 74 % of the Stat				
			9 Audited Financial	•			
		Statement) Pg	.10 and the TSA Sta	atement from [(Zer	nith Bank		
		• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	/05/2019) and UBA	Bank (10/5/2019-	31/12/2019)].		
	Strengthened Internally Generated Revenu	e (IGR)					
Collect	tion						
DLR	State implementing a consolidated						
4.1	state revenue code covering all state					Previously	
	IGR sources and stipulating that the					Achieved	
	state bureau of internal revenue is the					in 2018 APA	
	sole agency responsible for state						
	revenue collection and accounting.						
	Code must be approved by the state						
	legislature and published						
DLR	Annual nominal IGR growth rate meets					Achieved	
4.2	target					Stretch	
						target met	
1	Has the 2019-2018 annual nominal IGR	a. Accrual basi	s of accounting is ι	ised for revenue re	porting in	Satisfactory	
	growth rate met the basic or stretch	2018 and 2019	from the Audited	Financial Statemen	nts		
	targets?						
		b. The IVA con	nputed the annual	nominal IGR growt	h rate for this		
	Basic Target: 20%-39%		the computation b	_			
	Stretch Target: 40% or more	,	,				
			NGN		%		
					GROWTH		

Item	2018	2019	
1. Reported IGR in AFS (Before Adjustments)	11,463,188,810	17,199,206,405	50%
2. INVALID items to be deducted IF reported as part of IGR	147,661,139	- 3,860,550	
Sale of govt property, privatization proceeds	3,708,691	3,860,550	
Interest Earned	143,952,448		
3. "Adjusted IGR" for DLI 4.2 Calculation (A OR B)			
Take reported total IGR and deduct any INVALID items i.e. (1) minus (2)	11,315,527,671	17,195,345,855	52%

N17,195,345,855 - N11,315,527,671 x 100 N11,315,527,671 =**52**%

The annual nominal growth is 52%.

Source: 2019 Audited Financial Statement Pg. 7,39-45

Note: Further checks were conducted to validate the result. 1.The sum of N143,952,448 tagged 'Interest earned' was

deducted from the balance applied for the 2018 APA IGR figure in

	Biometric Registration and Bank Verification	the above calculation. The figure was not deducted from the 2018 IGR last year before computing the IGR growth rate for 2018FY. This however had no impact on the result.  2. There was no accrued revenue in the 2018 and 2019 AFS and no adjustments were made in this regard.		
DLR	o reduce Payroll Fraud  Biometric capture of at least [75]		Achieved	
5.1	percent of current civil servants and		Acilieveu	
	pensioners completed and linked to			
	payroll, and identified ghost workers			
	taken off the payroll			
1	Has the State used Biometrics to reduce payroll fraud through a completed biometric exercise for 75% of the current civil servants and pensioners on the State payroll?	The State commenced the Biometric data capture of the civil servants and pensioners on 12 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2018 and completed it on 23 <sup>rd</sup> January 2019. The details are below:  a. The biometric data capture was outsourced to Comsoft Nig. Ltd. Abuja.  b. The total no of civil servants is 14,094.  c. The total no of pensioners is 8,695.  d. The total no of staff on the State Nominal roll is 22,789, the total no of staff on the State Payroll is 22,020.  e. Biometrics data that has been captured 22,020.  f. The documents obtained for my conclusion are one-page progress report on biometric and the consultant report.  22,020 x 100 22,789 = 96.6%  The State had captured 96.6% of the State' civil servants and	Satisfactory	
		pensioners.		
2	Has the State linked the biometrics data to the State payroll to identify ghost workers?	a) The State commenced and finished the linkage of the biometric data to the payroll in January 2019.	Satisfactory	

		<ul> <li>b) 22,020 staff with biometrics data has been linked to the payroll.</li> <li>c) 769 retired workers were detected during the biometric validations.</li> <li>d) N1,103,463,768.24 was saved from the retired workers detected.</li> </ul>	
		<ul> <li>e) There are in-year changes to the civil servant and pensioner payrolls (because of starters, leavers, deaths etc.) are captured by the biometric exercise.</li> <li>f) There are procedures in place for ensuring timely (within 3 months of the event) updates to the payroll to reflect leavers, retirees, and deaths. The documents obtained to support the conclusion are the report of the Pay Parade Committee and response to questions concerning the State biometric capture exercise.</li> </ul>	
3	Has the State removed confirmed ghost workers and ghost pensioners within three (3) months of each case being confirmed?	<ul> <li>a) 769 workers were detected during the linkage as staff that have retired.</li> <li>b) The IVA confirmed that Kogi State Government List of Staff Expunged (as a result of study leave, sickness and death) from Payroll as at January, 2019 Biometric Exercise and Kogi State Government List of Staff that Retired and were removed From Payroll as at January, 2019. They were identified on 12<sup>th</sup> Nov, 2018 and removed from the payroll on 23<sup>rd</sup> January, 2019.</li> <li>c) The payroll figure prior to their removal from payroll was 22,789 staff.</li> <li>d) The payroll figure after they have been removed is 22,020 staff.</li> <li>e) The source(s) of these information is the one-page Progress Report on Biometric and BVN Exercise.</li> </ul>	Satisfactory
5.2	Link BVN data to at least [75] percent of current civil servants and pensioners on the payroll and payroll fraud addressed	·	Achieved
1	Has the State linked the Bank Verification Number data to 75% of its current Civil	The State commenced the linkage of BVN data of the civil servants and pensioners in December 2019 and is ongoing.	Satisfactory

2	Servants and pensioners on the State payroll?  Has the State taken steps to identify payroll fraud?	a) The Biometric was outsourced to Comsoft Nigeria Limited, Abuja. b) The total no of civil servants is 14,094. c) The total no of pensioners is 8,695. d) The total no of staff the State Nominal roll is 22,789. e) 22,020 BVN data has been linked to the payroll. f) The documents obtained are the one- page report on the payroll.  \[ \frac{22,020}{2,020} \times 100 \frac{\text{2020}}{\text{2020}} \times 100 \frac{\text{80}}{\text{9020}} \]  The State has linked 100 % of the State' civil servants and pensioners BVN data to the payroll.  a) Staff with BVN data are 22,020 and without BVN data are 769. b) There is no record of payroll fraud. c) The payroll figure prior to the identification and removal of retired staff is 22,789. d) The payroll figure after the removal of retired staff for further payments is 22,020. e) The sources of these information and reference documents obtained are the one- page progress report on payroll and Biometric, and the payroll.	Satisfactory	
	Improved Procurement Practices for used Transparency and Value for Money			
DLR 6.1	Existence of a public procurement legal framework and a procurement regulatory agency. Said legal framework should conform with the UNCITRAL Model Law and provide for: 1) e-Procurement; 2) establishment of an		Previously Achieved during the 2018 APA	

	independent procurement regulatory agency and 3) cover all MDAs receiving funds from the State budget					
1	Does the State have a public procurement legal framework which must be approved by the State legislature to have a legal basis, either as a law or a resolution?	<ul> <li>b) It has been approve 23rd October 2014</li> <li>c) The authorizing be Governor.</li> <li>d) The approval of the 2014.</li> <li>e) The date of its online</li> </ul>	ody is State House of assem e law occurred on the 20th ine publication is on the 24	as a law on the nbly and November  Ith June 2020.	Satisfactory	
2	Does the law conform with the UNCITRAL Model Law which should provide for? 1) e-Procurement; 2) establishment of an independent procurement regulatory agency; and 3) cover all MDAs receiving funds from the State budget.	<ul> <li>f) The source of online publication is the State official Website.</li> <li>The Kogi State Public Procurement Law is structured in line with the UNCITRAL Model and meets the requirements as shown below:</li> <li>1) E-Procurement. The team noted the following during the review of the legislation: <ul> <li>(Compliant); S.2(e); The Council shall approve changes in the procurement process to adapt to improvements in modern technology.</li> <li>Compliant; S.5(c) The Bureau shall introduce, develop, update and maintain related database and technology.</li> </ul> </li> <li>2) Establishment of the Public Procurement Agency and the Board is contained in Sections 1 and 2 of the Law. (Compliant).</li> <li>Independence - The results of the assessment of the legislation for independence are in the table below:</li> </ul>		Satisfactory		
		Required Provisions*	Result			
		The Functions and Powers of the Agency The composition of the board	Compliant; see sections 5 & 6 Compliant; See Section 1(2).			
		Membership of the Board/Council includes representatives from	Compliant; see sections 1(2)(g).			

				<del>                                     </del>
		Professional bodies and		
		associations.		
		The grounds for Compliant; see section 7(4)		
		removal of the Chief		
		Executive of the		
		agency.		
		Regarding decisions of Compliant; See Section 53(8)		
		the Agency; Any other		
		review after the Board's decision should		
		be by judicial review		
		*Provided by the World Bank		
		Florided by the World Balik		
		3. Establishment of an independent procurement regulatory		
		agency -		
		a) The law provided for the establishment of an independent		
		·		
		procurement regulatory agency. See Sections 1 and 2.		
		b) The law covers all MDAs receiving funds from State budget.		
		See Section 15(1).		
3	Has the State instituted an independent	a) The State has instituted an independent procurement	Satisfactory	
	procurement regulatory function, which	regulatory function.		
	may be performed through one or a	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	combination of the following: bureau,	b) It is being performed through Kogi Bureau of Public		
	•	Procurement.		
	commission, council, agency or any other	c) The agency is responsible for prescribing regulations and		
	type of entity set up for the statutory	procedures for public procurements in accordance with the		
	purpose?	legal framework.		
		d) IVA visited the Kogi State Bureau of Public Procurement (BPP)		
		Office, interviewed the Representative of Chief Executive of		
		•		
		BPP and the management staff. The agency was physically		
		inspected, and some operational staff interviewed.		
		e) The IVA team reviewed records of all		
		procurements/cases/transactions handled by the Agency in		
		the year under assessment.		
		f) A sample of 5 cases/transaction handled by the agency were		
		selected at random and conducted walkthroughs and file		
		reviews.		

DLR 6.2	Publish contract award information above a threshold set out in the Operations Manual for 2019 on a monthly basis in OCDS format on [the	g)	Physical inspection of the agency, interviews with operational staff selected at random, and reviewed records showed that the agency is functioning.	Achieved	
1	Has the State achieved open contracting component of the DLI by publishing online, contract award information for all contracts awarded during the fiscal year(2019) that are above the threshold (as defined in the State procurement law or in the State procurement regulation(s), in line with the Open Contracting Data Standards (OCDS).	a) b) c) d)	kogibpp.org/kogioc.	Satisfactory	
	Strengthened Public Debt Management and Responsibility Framework	d			
DLR	State implementing state-level debt			Previously	
7.1	legislation, which stipulates: 1) responsibilities for contracting state debt; 2) responsibilities for recording/reporting state debt; and 3) fiscal and debt rules/limits.			Achieved in 2018 APA	
1	Is there an Approved state-level public debt legislation through the passage of a State Fiscal Responsibility Law, OR the passage of the State Public Debt Management Law, OR the inclusion of the provisions of the Fiscal Responsibility Act (FRA) in the organic PFM Law?	a) b)	DLI already achieved in 2018 APA	Satisfactory	
2	Does the legislation include provisions which establish the following?	a) a)	DLI already achieved in 2018 APA	Satisfactory	

	1) Responsibilities for contracting state debt; 2) Responsibilities for recording/reporting state debt; and 3) Fiscal and debt rules/limits for the state.	b)	
3	Has the State Debt Management Department (or Unit, Committee, Agency, Board, Bureau, Commission, Council) has been operational during the APA year and performing the core function of recording and reporting state debt.	a) DLI already achieved in 2018 APA .	Satisfactory
DLR 7.2	Quarterly State debt reports accepted by the DMO on average two months or less after the end of the quarters in 2019		Achieved
1	Has the State produced quarterly State Domestic Debt Reports (SDDR), which are approved by the DMO on average of two months after the end of the quarter in 2019?	<ul> <li>a) The state produced quarterly domestic debt reports approved by the DMO on average of 1 month and 2 weeks after the end of the quarter.</li> <li>The team obtained evidence that the State produced quarterly SDDRs, which were submitted and received by the DMO as follows: <ul> <li>Q1 submitted on (20/05/2019) 7.1weeks (50),</li> <li>Q2 submitted on (19/08/2019) 7.1weeks (50),</li> <li>Q3 submitted on (1/11/2019) 4.6 weeks (32)</li> <li>Q4 submitted on (12/02/2020) 6.1weeks (43).</li> <li>= 7.1+7.1+4.6+6.1</li> <li>4</li> <li>=6.2 weeks</li> </ul> </li> <li>The SDDRs were submitted within an average of 1 months and 2 weeks (43 days).</li> </ul>	Satisfactory
2	Note: Have you reviewed for accuracy and completeness from the DMO:	The IVA reviewed the DMO's Report on State Domestic and External Debt Report (SDEDR) with the Kogi State Debt Domestic Report, but the figures are not the same.	n/a

DLI 8:	The State Domestic and External Debt Report (SDEDR) along with all underlying data and supporting documents including the DMO templates and guidelines and standard internal protocols and data from CBN, DMO and FMOF Home Finance used by the DMO to cross-check the state's domestic debt figures.	The domestic debt figure reported in the SDEDR is N102,354,370,489 while the debt stock figure reported in the State domestic debt is N81,414,138,518.55. It shows a difference of N20,940,231,970.45. The report was supported with the DMO's templates and guidelines.  We reviewed the DMO report and the DMO report confirmed the accuracy and completeness of the State Domestic Debt Report.  A wider review was undertaken of the information and supporting schedules submitted by the DMO, and several clarifications and adjustments were made to correct errors and omissions in the state's submission to the DMO. Conclusions reached in this report are based on the amended DMO data.		
	stic Expenditure Arrears			
DLR	Domestic arrears as of end 2019		Achieved	
8.0	reported in an online publicly accessible		(Stretch	
	database, with a verification process in place and an arrears clearance		Target)	
	framework established.  AND			
	Percentage decline in the verified stock			
	of domestic arrears at end 2019			
	compared to end 2018 meets target and is consistent with the state's arrears			
	clearance framework.			
	-Basic target: At least a 5% decline or			
	maintain stock below N5 billion			
1	-Stretch target: More than 20% decline  Has the State established an Arrears		Satisfactors	
1	Clearance Framework (ACF)?	a) The State has established an Arrears Clearance Framework	Satisfactory	
	Sicarance Francework (Acr):	(ACF). b) A copy of the ACF was obtained from the State.		
<u> </u>	<u> </u>	a, cop, c. the rich mas obtained from the state.		

		c) The establishment of the 2019 ACF occurred by the 11th Dec 2019. We sought to clarify how the State was able to ensure that arrears were cleared in accordance with the framework in 2019, if the ACF was established on 11 December 2019. We found that the State had an ACF in place from 2018 which was published online on 23 December, 2019 although it was not provided to the IVA during the 2018 APA.  The weblink for the 2019 and 1018 ACF: <a href="https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/Kogi-State-Arrears-Clearance-Framework-Document-2018.pdf">https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/Kogi-State-Arrears-Clearance-Framework-Document-2018.pdf</a> And <a href="https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/2019-Kogi-ACF.pdf">https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/2019-Kogi-ACF.pdf</a>	
2	Does the ACF contain: 1) the planned actions to settle arrears; and 2) an explicit prioritization of expenditure arrears to be settled.	<ul> <li>a) The ACF contains planned actions to settle arrears and an explicit prioritization of expenditure arrears to be settled.</li> <li>b) The evidence seen when reviewing the ACF that shows the ACF contains the two stated requirements are in page 8 of the ACF.</li> <li>c) Other documents submitted by the state to confirm the ACF exists is a hard copy of the ACF.</li> </ul>	Satisfactory
3	Has the ACF been published on a State official website?	<ul> <li>a) The State has published an Arrears Clearance Framework (ACF) on the state official website.</li> <li>b) The 2018 Arrears clearance framework was published on 23 December, 2019.</li> </ul>	Satisfactory
4.	Is the clearance of domestic expenditure arrears consistent with the ACF, once the ACF has been established?	The clearance of domestic expenditure arrears is consistent with the ACF. The State provided clarification that a verification exercise was conducted and the arrears were cleared in the order of priority stated in the framework.	Satisfactory
5.	Has the State established an Internal Domestic Arrears Database?	<ul> <li>a) The State has established an Internal Domestic Arrears         Database.     </li> <li>b) The Internal Domestic Arears Database includes the         following;     </li> </ul>	Satisfactory

		<ul> <li>i. The aggregate and individual amounts of contractors' arrears is N111,680,614.00</li> <li>ii. The aggregate amount of pension and gratuity arrears is N592,474,560.</li> <li>iii. The aggregate amount of salary arrears and other staff claims is N131,874,099.</li> <li>iv. No aggregate amount of other types of domestic arrears.</li> <li>c) A verification process is in place for the arrears in the database.</li> <li>d) We confirmed through the evidence provided by the State that the State has conducted verification of arrears balances.</li> <li>e) We conducted tests to ascertain the accuracy of the figure in the internal domestic arrears database, including crosschecking with State account balances, payroll records, underlying contract data etc.</li> </ul>	
6	Has the State published online elements of the internal domestic arrears database for the FY 2018 and FY 2019 reported on a State official website, which constitutes the online publicly accessible arrears database?	<ul> <li>a) The State has published online the required elements of Internal Domestic Arrears Database as at end of 2018 and 2019.</li> <li>b) We compared the aggregate and individual information available on the online publicly accessible arrears database with the information in the internal domestic arrears database and verified the consistency and accuracy of the information on the online publicly accessible arrears database.</li> <li>c) The website supporting the online publicly-accessible arrears database contains an electronic link that permits any potential contractor creditor whose individual claim is not listed in the database to communicate this exclusion to the State Ministry of Finance, by filling a confidential form online and attaching supportive evidence of her claim. If the State Ministry of Finance confirms the validity of this claim, it shall be added to the internal domestic arrears database and included as relevant in the online publicly accessible arrears database.</li> </ul>	Satisfactory

7. New	Does the online publication include?  1) the aggregate amount of contractors' arrears; 2) the aggregate amount of pension	the State. e) The test of to report a through the screenshot f) The source https://www.State.  The State has a accessible to the claim on any or The online pub following: (a) The aggregation of the state aggregation of the state has a accessible to the claim on any or the online pub following:	<ul> <li>e) The test of the facility for contractors with arrears (creditors) to report any omissions to the State. A message was sent through the facility and the message was responded to and a screenshot was obtained.</li> <li>f) The source of information is on https://www.kogistate.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/Kogi-State.</li> <li>The State has an internal arrears clearance database that is accessible to the public and individual contractors can make claim on any omission.</li> <li>The online publicly accessible arrears database includes the following:         <ul> <li>(a) The aggregate amount of contractors' arrears. N111,680,614.</li> <li>(b) The aggregate amount of pension and gratuity arrears.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>			Satisfactory	
	and gratuity arrears; 3) the aggregate amount of salary arrears and other staff claims; 4) other types of domestic arrears and 5) a list of names of contractors with recognized arrears exceeding N20million and information for contractors to be able to verify that their claims are being accurately reported in the database.	<ul> <li>(c) The aggregate amount of salary arrears and other staff claims. N131,874,099.</li> <li>(d) The State does not have other types of domestic arrears.</li> <li>(e) A list of names of contractors with recognized arrears exceeding 20 million naira and information for contractors to be able to verify that their claims are being accurately reported in the database.</li> </ul>					
New	Has the State met the following:  (ii) Percentage decline in the verified stock of domestic arrears at end 2019 compared to end 2018 meets target and is consistent with the state's arrears clearance framework.	Aggregate Amount of: Contractors Arrears Pension and Gratuity arrears	<b>2019</b> 111,680,614.00 592,474,560.00	2018 28,934,435,963.24 12,216,707,890.00		Satisfactory	

-Basic target: At least a 5% year-on-year decline or maintain stock or arrears below N5billion.

**-Stretch target:** More than 20% year-on-year decline.

The clearance/reduction of domestic expenditure arrears (contractors, pension and gratuity arrears, salary arrears and other staff claims) is defined as the decline in the nominal stock of total domestic expenditure arrears at the end of year, compared to the previous year, expressed in percentage terms.

Salary arrears and Staff claims	131,874,099.00	16,340,838,225.51
Other types of domestic expenditure arrears	-	-
Total Domestic Arrears	836,029,273.00	57,491,982,078.75

a. We obtained the Domestic arrears figure from the State Internal Domestic Arrears (SIDA) database.

57,491,982,078.75 - 836,029,273.00 X 100 57,491,982,078.75

= 98.55% (but see recalculation below)

The percentage decline is 98.55%

**Source**: State internal domestic expenditure arrears database.

**Note:** Further work was done to ascertain how the State was able to reduce its arrears by over N56bn in one year. The figures were confirmed to the audited financial statements, and the State also provided clarification that invalid arrears were discovered during verification exercise and were dropped. The amount found to be invalid through the verification is N47,287,063,360.44 and the amount cleared through arrears clearance is N9,368,889,445.31.

The above calculation was reperformed based on the adjusted arrears balance (i.e. excluding the invalid arrears) and the percentage decline was found to be as follows;

Adjusted arrears: N57,491,982,078.75 - N47,287,063,360.44 = N10,204,918,718.31

ted the percentage of total monthly service oss FAAC Allocation for this year APA. eduction N7,670,613,483.67 x100
ted the percentage of total monthly service oss FAAC Allocation for this year APA. eduction N7,670,613,483.67 x100
ted the percentage of total monthly service oss FAAC Allocation for this year APA. eduction N7,670,613,483.67 x100
oss FAAC Allocation for this year APA. eduction N7,670,613,483.67 x100
oss FAAC Allocation for this year APA. eduction N7,670,613,483.67 x100
N60,123,017,088.36 = 12.8% FAAC data (reported by NBS online)
Satisfactory appropriate figures for this comparison.    bt   Financial   DMO figures   (Adjusted)     estic Debts   81,414,138,518.55   102,354,370,489     nal Debts   8,642,924,552   9,334,758,973.68     c Debts   90,057,063,071   111,689,129,462
e ne

Total Revenue**	81,000,635,244
Other Revenues	-
Grants	2,977,389,612
Gross FAAC Allocation	60,827,899,777
2019 Adjusted IGR (see DLI 4.2)	17,195,345,855

a. The State's domestic debt stock figure in the Federal DMO State Domestic and External Debt Report for 2019 is as at the end of Q4 2019.

We have computed the total debts stock / Revenue percentage for the 2019 year, as follows:

<u>Total Public Debts\*</u> x 100 Total Revenue

<u>N111,689,129,462\*</u> x 100 N81,000,635,244

=137.9%

**Sources:** For Total Revenue 2019 Audited Financial Statement, Pg 7. For Total Public Debt from DMO\* as at December 31,2019

- b. The debt stock stated in the Federal DMO State Domestic and External Debt Report is not the same with the debt stock stated in the audited financial statement.
  - c. The total debt figure reported in the SDEDR is N111,689,129,462 while the total debt figure reported in the Audited Financial Statement is N90,057,063,071. The difference in figure is N21,632,066,391
- d. The difference has been communicated to the State for explanation,

<sup>\*</sup>Table 3 below holds a breakdown of the Total Debt.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Table 3(ii) holds the breakdown of Revenue

e. The difference has been calculated in value and percentage	
terms,	
(i)Difference in value- N21,632,066,391	
(ii) Difference in percentage=	
<u>₩111,689,129,462-</u> ₩90,057,063,071 X 100	
₩111,689,129,462	
=19%	
f. The SDEDR was amended and resubmitted to the IVA along	
with explanations for changes.	

TABLE 3: DLI 9 31 DECEMBER 2019 STATE DEBT STOCK TABLE FOR KOGI STATE

KOGI STATE	AMOUNT (₦)
BUDGET SUPPORT LOAN (SOURCE FMOF)	21,015,319,425
BAIL OUT (SALARIES) (SOURCE CBN)	48,705,036,887
RESTRUCTURED COMMERCIAL BANK LOANS (FGN BOND)	769,129,547
EXCESS CRUDE ACCOUNT BACKED LOAN (SOURCE CBN)	9,243,555,407
STATE BONDS	6,188,939,505
COMMERCIAL BANK LOANS	14,238,938,616
CBN COMMERCIAL AGRIC LOAN (SOURCE CBN)	-
INFRASTRUCTURE LOANS (CBN FACILITIES)	-
MICRO SMALL MEDIUM ENTERPRISES DEVELOPMENT FUND (MSMEDF) SOURCE CBN)	1,357,421,830
JUDGEMENT DEBTS	-
GOVT - GOVT DEBTS	-
CONTRACTORS' ARREARS	111,680,614
PENSION AND GRATUITY ARREARS	592,474,560
SALARY ARREARS AND OTHER CLAIMS	131,874,099
OTHER DEBTS	-
TOTAL DOMESTIC DEBT (TDD)	102,354,370,489
TOTAL EXTERNAL DEBT (TED)	9,334,758,974
TOTAL PUBLIC DEBT (TED+TDD)	111,689,129,462

#### TABLE 3(ii): DLI 9 31 DECEMBER 2019 REVENUE FOR KOGI STATE

	NGN
Item	2019
1. Total Gross FAAC allocation: Statutory Transfers and VAT (1.1 + 1.2)	60,827,899,777
1.1 Statutory transfers (1.1.1 + 1.1.2 + 1.1.3)	48,741,034,875
1.1.1 Gross statutory allocation	48,741,034,875
1.1.2 Derivation	-
1.1.3 Other FAAC transfers (also known as Distribution) such excess PPT savings account, Forex equalization, excess bank charges, exchange rate gain, augmentation, others	-
1.2 VAT	12,086,864,902
2. Internally Generated Revenues (IGR) - Adjusted	17,195,345,855
3. Grants (internal and external)	2,977,389,612
<b>4A.</b> Other revenues (4.1 + 4.2 + 4.3)	
4.1 Investment Income (e.g. dividends)	-
4.2 Interest Earned	-
4.3 Miscellaneous	-
Total Revenues and Grants Calculations	
A) Total Revenues and Grants is (1+2+3+4A)	81,000,635,244

## 4. Response from the State

The State should please use the table below for their response.

S	5/N	State Response to the draft report	IVA Follow-up, response, treatment
1		None	

#### **Appendix A**

#### REPORT ON THE ACHIEVEMENT OF THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR THE 2019 PERFORMANCE YEAR

## YOUR STATE HAS BEEN ASSESSED AS HAVING MET THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR THE 2019 PERFORMANCE YEAR.

This report sets out the assessed performance of the State against the set eligibility criteria for the States' Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability Programme (SFTAS). It contains feedback and clarifications to enable the State prepare better for the next assessment. Note that the eligibility assessment will be conducted afresh on an annual basis and being deemed eligible in one year does not guarantee eligibility in subsequent years. Please visit the SFTAS guidelines for more detail on eligibility.

Any enquiries on the contents of this report should be routed through the State Focal persons to the following email address – sftas@oaugf.ng

## Eligibility Criteria 2019 Part I - The online publication of Approved Budgets for 2020 by 31<sup>st</sup> January 2020

Information Source(s)	Initial checks	Initial Comments / Observations	Follow up	Final Assessment
https://www.kogis	A search was	The 2020 Budget	N/A	EC met
tate.gov.ng/wp-	done on Kogi	was published on		
content/uploads/2	State website	the State Official		
<u>020-</u>		website, a copy		
APPROPRIATION-		was downloaded.		
LAW-5.pdf		There was		
		evidence of the		
		2020 Budget being		
		signed by the		
		Governor.		

Tests/checks performed	Results	Areas for improvement
Is the approved budget for 2020 available on any	Yes	None
of the State Government Websites?		
Was the approved budget published online before	Yes	None
31 January 2020?		
Is the published budget clear and legible?	Yes	None
Can the budget be downloaded?	Yes	None
Do we have evidence of assent by the Governor?	Yes	None

# Eligibility Criteria 2019 Part 2 - The online publication of Audited Financial Statements for FY2018 by $30^{\text{th}}$ September 2019

Source(s)	Initial Work Done	Initial Comments /	Follow	Final
		Observation	up	Assessment
https://kogistate.gov.ng/docu ment/2018-financial- statement.pdf	A search was done on the Kogi State Website and the Audited Financial Statements were downloaded.	The Audited Financial Statements were easily accessed and downloaded.	N/A	EC met

Tests/checks performed	Results	Areas for improvement
Were the Financial Statements (FS) for 2018 available	Yes	None
on any of the State Government Websites? (and were		
the FS straightforward or difficult to find?)		
Were the Financial Statement for 2018 available	Yes	None
published online before 30 <sup>th</sup> September 2019?		
Are the published financial statements clear and	Yes	None
legible?		
Can the Financial Statements be downloaded?	Yes	None
Do we have evidence of audit by the State Auditor-	Yes	None
General?		
Are the financial statements complete, including	Yes	None
primary statements and disclosure notes?		
Are there any indications that balances within the	n/a	Please see the 2018 APA Report
financial statements are not credible		