The States' Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability (SFTAS) Program for Results

ASSESSMENT REPORT

NEW DISBURSEMENT-LINKED INDICATORS (DLIs) DECEMBER 2021

BAUCHI STATE

By:

The Office of the Auditor-General for the Federation as the SFTAS Independent Verification Agent with support from PricewaterhouseCoopers (PwC)

NOVEMBER 2022

Table of Contents

1. Executive Summary

This Report details the outcome of the New 2021 Disbursement Linked Indicators 11.3 (JUN 2022) Verification. In conducting the verification, the IVA assessed how the State performed against the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) listed within the SFTAS DLI Matrix, Guidelines and Verification Protocol.

Table 1 (below) reflects the outcome of the verification and shows areas where the State achieved results. In total, Bauchi State achieved 1 (One) DLR out of 1 (One) DLR applicable to the New DLIs (December 2021 to June 2022).

We included the findings from the verification exercise and identified several areas where the State can improve its performance. These are set out in detail within Section 2 of this report.

1.1   Table 1: Assessment Results' Summary

Key:	Achieved	Not Achieved	Previously Achieved

Disbursement Linked Indicators	Disbursement Linked Results	Results	Remarks
DLI 11: Provided structured tax relief in response to COVID-19 and strengthened tax administration (personal income tax and property taxation) to enhance non-oil tax collection in the resilient recovery phase	**DLR 11.3: Strengthened the foundation for state property taxation by updating property records in urban areas**	**Achieved (Base)**	

2. Bauchi State Assessment results for DLR 11.3

2.1 Results for DLR 11.3

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
DLR 11.3 2021	**(2021) Strengthened the foundation for state property taxation by updating property records in urban areas**		**Achieved (Base)**	
1.	1. Has the State completed or updated property records of at least a certain percentage of all properties that have electricity connections in urban areas? Base target= percentage properties enumerated out of total properties with an electricity connection is 20% Stretch target= percentage properties enumerated out of total properties with an electricity connection is 50%	a. IVA obtained a report accompanied by the data set with property records with supporting evidence from the State to show that they have met target for the records submitted and all mandatory fields are included. The States (i) delivered data in **excel** format (ii) used the standardized codes for the mandatory variables that have been shared (iii) submitted 3 separate files for parcels, buildings and building units. b. The State's total number for properties with electricity connections in urban areas as provided by the World Bank is 184,666. c. The total number of properties enumerated which have data for all mandatory fields (see annex 2) for the electrified urban areas used by the World Bank for setting the target: vacant parcel + buildings + building units registered for legal entity) are as follows: Vacant parcel -0 buildings – 62,686 building units – 62,686 **Total – 125,372**	Satisfactory (Basic Target)	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
	IVA observed that there were some anomalies in the data presented by the State that it is not possible that buildings and building units have 62,686. It is therefore considered as double counting and only one of the data was considered. Thus, the result was recomputed as follows: 62,686 x 100 184,666 =33.94%. d. IVA computed the percentage of: Total number of properties enumerated which have data for all mandatory fields/ (total number for properties with electricity connections in urban areas as provided by the World Bank as follows: $$\frac{125,372 \times 100}{184,666}$$ $$= 67.89\%$$ Due to the double counting in the data presented to the IVA, the re-computation was done as follows: 62,686 x 100 184,666 =33.94%. The State Achieved a Basic Target		
2. The property information is no older than August 31, 2020?	IVA verified the evidence provided by the State and confirmed that the records submitted to meet the target the information was	Satisfactory (Basic Target)	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
	updated or collected after August 31, 2020 as shown in the computation below: $$\frac{125,372 \times 100}{184,666} = 67.89\%$$ Due to the double records provided, this was recomputed as follows: $$\frac{62,686 \times 100}{184,666} = 33.94\%.$$		
3. The property records submitted have a unique ID that links parcels, buildings, and building units?	1. IVA computed from buildings file, the number of records [without missing value] for Building ID and Parcel ID as follows: <table><tr><td rowspan="2">ID linking with structure footprint</td><td>Building ID</td><td>62,686</td></tr><tr><td>Parcel ID</td><td>62,686</td></tr></table> 2. IVA computed from building units file, number of records [without missing value] for Building ID and Building Unit ID as follows: <table><tr><td>Unique ID linking to buildings</td><td>Building ID</td><td>62,686</td></tr><tr><td>Unique ID of building units</td><td>Unit ID</td><td>62,686</td></tr></table> The Building and Building Units presented by the State contain the same numbers, which is an anomaly. Thus, one of the sets of data is removed to prevent double counting.	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
	The percentage of the number of complete building records + number of complete building units) to the number of building records needed for meeting base or stretch target (– see 1.1.) is as follows: $$\frac{62{,}686 \times 100}{36{,}933.2}$$ = 169.72%		
4. The size of the land parcel is documented by a polygon on a map/indicated as ParcelArea in the file?	IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records for the variable **Parcel Area** in the file with **parcel records** to all vacant parcel records submitted as follows: <table><tr><td>ParcelArea</td><td>19,019</td></tr><tr><td>Vacant Parcel submitted</td><td>0</td></tr></table> $$\frac{19{,}019 \times 100}{0}$$ =More than 100%	Satisfactory (The State met 1.1/1.2)	
5. The parcel is linked to buildings (one to one or one to many)?	IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records for the variable **Parcel ID** in the **building** records file) to all records needed for meeting base target as follows: <table><tr><td>ParcelID</td><td>Enumeration Parcel GUID (Base Target Number for the State)</td></tr><tr><td>62,686</td><td>36,933.2</td></tr></table> $$\frac{62{,}686 \times 100}{36{,}933.2}$$ = 169.73%	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
6. The number of occupancy units within the property are included?	a. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records for the variable **No of Units** in the **building** records file) to all records needed for meeting base target as follows: 	No of Units	62,686
---	---
Base Target	36,933.2 | $$\frac{62,686 \times 100}{36,933.2}$$ $$= 169.73\%$$ b. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records for the variable **StructPres** in the **Parcel** records file to all vacant parcel records submitted as follows: Structure Presence in Parcel Records to All vacant parcel records: $$\frac{19,019 \times 100}{0}$$ $$= \text{More than } 100\%$$ Structure Presence in Parcel Records to Base Target: | StructPres	19,019
---	---
Base Target	36,933.2 | $$\frac{19,019 \times 100}{36,933.2}$$ $$= 51.50\%$$	Satisfactory (The State met 1.1/1.2)	
7. Has the following information been included in each of the property records of the State: i. Main Use	a. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records in the **building** records file for each of the following variables: (BldgUse; OccupType; NoOfFloors; BldgAge; WallMat; RoofMat;	Satisfactory (1.1 & 1.2 have been met)	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
ii. Occupancy Type iii. Number of dwelling units iv. No of floors v. Age of building vi. Wall material vii. Roof material viii. Formal/Informal document ix. Access to sewerage, water, waste disposal and electricity	BldgArea; Picture)/ all records needed for meeting base target as follows: $$\frac{62,686 \times 100}{36,933.2}$$ $$= 169.73\%$$ 	BldgUse	YES
OccupType	YES
NoOfFloors	YES
BldgAge	YES
WallMat	YES
RoofMat	YES
BldgArea	YES
Picture	YES | b. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records in the **parcel** file for each of the following variables: (Document; Water; Sewerage; Power; Waste)/ total number of vacant parcel records as follows: No of Completed records to Vacant Parcel records: $$\frac{19,019 \times 100}{o}$$ = More than 100% No of completed records to Base Target $$\frac{19,019 \times 100}{36,933.2}$$ $$= 51.50\%$$		

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
	<table><tr><td>Document</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>Water</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>Sewerage</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>Power</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>Waste</td><td>YES</td></tr></table>		

8. Are the ownership characteristics captured?
  i. Single or multiple owner
  ii. Telephone
  iii. Address
	a. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records in the **parcel** records file for each of the following variables: (OwnerName; TypeOwner; ParcelUse; OccupType; OwnerPhone; ParcelAddr)/ total number of vacant parcel records as follows:
	
	$$\frac{19{,}019 \times 100}{0}$$
	= More than 100%
	
	<table><tr><td>OwnerName</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>TypeOwner</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>ParcelUse</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>OccupType</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>OwnerPhone</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>ParcelAddr</td><td>YES</td></tr></table>
		Satisfactory (1.1/1.2 has been met)	

2 1. The property records are stored in an electronic database?	a. The IVA obtained an electronic copy of the Property records. The IVA confirms that the copy received was in MS Excel. b. Property records were stored in the server Via the link below: All Buildings - http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/structure.php	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
	GET one building using a building id (where 284004270 is a building id) http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/structure_one.php?BuildingID=284004270 All Parcels http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/parcel.php GET one parcel using parcel id (where 284022677 is a parcel id) http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/parcel_one.php?parcelid=284022677 Location: Cloud c. The State provided documentation showing the Location of the IP/URL of Server as All Buildings - http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/structure.php GET one building using a building id (where 284004270 is a building id) http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/structure_one.php?BuildingID=284004270 All Parcels http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/parcel.php GET one parcel using parcel id (where 284022677 is a parcel id) http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/parcel_one.php?parcelid=284022677		

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
2. The property record database is accessible to SIRS/SBIR in electronic format?	a. The SIRS has been granted access to the database. A demand notice has been provided as evidence. b. IVA visited the URL provided by the State to demonstrate Access to the Billing Software via IP/URL as follows: https://dli.bauchigeoinfoservices.org.ng/dnotice Username: BASIRS Password: 123456 STEPS 1. Login with the details above 2. Click on Generate Demand Notice 3. Select LGA 4. Enter Full name of Property Owner or Parcel ID in the Search Box Then click on Generate Demand Notice from the right Hand-side. c. The states' API listing parameters are: http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/structure.php, http://109.70.148.57/~miapolyc/bauchi/parcel.php	Satisfactory	
3. The database has started being used to issue demand notices?	a. Sample demand notices were shared by SIRS as evidence that the API in place can generate Demand Notices. b. The IVA has conducted spot checks to confirm that the Billing System enables generating demand notice for five randomly selected properties.	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
3	1. Has the state issued a regulation that mandates that property data collected is shared with MDAs?	a. IVA has obtained and retained a copy of the regulation. b. The regulation was signed by the Executive Chairman of the Bauchi SIRS with Gazette date of September 2021. The law came into effect on 1st September 2021. c. IVA confirmed that the regulation mandates the state to share the data collected with MDAs in line with the key requirements captured in the draft model regulations issued to all states.	Satisfactory	
	2. States have distributed the regulations to appropriate MDAs and the SIRS/SBIR?	a. IVA has obtained from the State, a report with supporting evidence that the States have distributed the regulations to appropriate MDAs and the SIRS/SBIR.	Satisfactory	
	3. A copy of the tax demand notice for property related charges/taxes?	a. IVA obtained a copy of the updated demand notice. b. IVA obtained a copy of the Amended notice and confirmed that it includes the geotag (Parcel ID Reference and Coordinates) and provides the information that will allow any party to access the geotag information. c. IVA confirmed that the demand notice includes details of the taxes and charges including information on discounts for early payment and penalties for late payment requiring the property owner to pay within 30 days as follows: **Notice Due Date:** This invoice/Demand Notice will be due from the date generated **Discount:** Section 5 of the 2022 Law provided a 50% discount for paying before the due date. **Penalties:** Section 5 of the 2022 Law stipulates that a failure to pay within the stipulated time and by the due date will lead an increase in the liability, 50% if paid between 1st January to 31st March. Date If payment is not made within the expiration of then	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
	the property may be liable to being revoked by virtue of Section 5 of 2022 Law.		
4. A tax demand notice for property related charges/taxes has been amended to include geotag of property?	IVA obtained copies of demand notices and it showed that demand notices included Coordinates and Parcel ID as part of its geotag details.	Satisfactory	

3. Response from the State

The State should please use the table below for their response.

S/N	State Response to the draft report	IVA Follow-up, response, treatment
1		
2		
3		
4		