



# **The States' Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Sustainability (SFTAS) Program for Results**

## **ASSESSMENT REPORT**

**NEW DISBURSEMENT-LINKED INDICATORS (DLIs) DECEMBER 2021**

## **LAGOS STATE**

**By:**

**The Office of the Auditor-General for the Federation as the SFTAS Independent Verification Agent  
with support from [PricewaterhouseCoopers \(PwC\)](#)**



**NOVEMBER 2022**

## Table of Contents

<a href="#">1. Executive Summary</a> .....	3
<a href="#">1.1 Table 1: Assessment Results' Summary</a> .....	3
<a href="#">2. Lagos State Assessment results for DLR 11.3</a> .....	4
<a href="#">2.1 Results for DLR 11.3</a> .....	4
<a href="#">3. Response from the State</a> .....	13

# 1. Executive Summary

---

This Report details the outcome of the New 2021 Disbursement Linked Indicators 11.3 (JUN 2022) Verification. In conducting the verification, the IVA assessed how the State performed against the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) listed within the SFTAS DLI Matrix, Guidelines and Verification Protocol.

**Table 1** (below) reflects the outcome of the verification and shows areas where the State achieved results. In total, Lagos State achieved 1 (One) DLR out of 1 (One) DLR applicable to the New DLIs (December 2021 to June 2022).

We included the findings from the verification exercise and identified several areas where the State can improve its performance. These are set out in detail within Section 2 of this report.

## 1.1 Table 1: Assessment Results' Summary

Key:	Achieved	Not Achieved	Previously Achieved
------	----------	--------------	---------------------

Disbursement Linked Indicators	Disbursement Linked Results	Results	Remarks
DLI 11: Provided structured tax relief in response to COVID-19 and strengthened tax administration (personal income tax and property taxation) to enhance non-oil tax collection in the resilient recovery phase	DLR 11.3: Strengthened the foundation for state property taxation by updating property records in urban areas	Achieved (Basic)	

## 2. Lagos State Assessment results for DLR 11.3

### 2.1 Results for DLR 11.3

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
<b>DLR 11.3 2021</b>	<b>(2021) Strengthened the foundation for state property taxation by updating property records in urban areas</b>		<b>Achieved</b>	
<b>1.</b>	<p>1. Has the State completed or updated property records of at least a certain percentage of all properties that have electricity connections in urban areas?</p> <p>Base target= percentage properties enumerated out of total properties with an electricity connection is 20%</p> <p>Stretch target= percentage properties enumerated out of total properties with an electricity connection is 50%</p>	<p>a. IVA obtained a report accompanied by the data set with property records with supporting evidence from the State to show that they have met target for the records submitted and all mandatory fields are included. The States</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(i) delivered data in <b>excel</b> format</li> <li>(ii) used the standardized codes for the mandatory variables that have been shared</li> <li>(iii) submitted 3 separate files for parcels, buildings and building units.</li> </ul> <p>b. The State’s total number for properties with electricity connections in urban areas as provided by the World Bank is 1820556.</p> <p>c. The total number of properties enumerated which have data for all mandatory fields (see annex 2) for the electrified urban areas used by the World Bank for setting the target: vacant parcel + buildings + building units registered for legal entity) are as follows:            Vacant parcel -5094            buildings – 394412            building units -283820  <b>Total – 683,326</b></p> <p>d. IVA computed the percentage of:</p>	Satisfactory (Basic Target)	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations												
	<p>Total number of properties enumerated which have data for all mandatory fields/ (total number for properties with electricity connections in urban areas as provided by the World Bank as follows:</p> $\frac{683326 \times 100}{1820556} = 37.53\%$														
<p>2. The property information is no older than August 31, 2020?</p>	<p>IVA verified the evidence provided by the State (The Enumeration dates) and confirmed that the records submitted to meet the target the information was updated or collected after August 31, 2020 as shown in the computation below:</p> $\frac{430933 \times 100}{1820556} = 23.67\%$	<p>Satisfactory (Basic Target)</p>													
<p>3. The property records submitted have a unique ID that links parcels, buildings, and building units?</p>	<p>1. IVA computed from buildings file, the number of records [without missing value] for Building ID and Parcel ID as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="772 861 1574 976"> <tr> <td data-bbox="772 861 1048 922">ID linking with structure footprint</td> <td data-bbox="1048 861 1220 922">Building ID</td> <td data-bbox="1220 861 1574 922">204954</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="772 922 1048 976"></td> <td data-bbox="1048 922 1220 976">Parcel ID</td> <td data-bbox="1220 922 1574 976">204954</td> </tr> </table> <p>2. IVA computed from building units file, number of records [without missing value] for Building ID and Building Unit ID as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="761 1152 1554 1273"> <tr> <td data-bbox="761 1152 1003 1212">Unique ID linking to buildings</td> <td data-bbox="1003 1152 1176 1212">Building ID</td> <td data-bbox="1176 1152 1554 1212">204954</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="761 1212 1003 1273">Unique ID of building units</td> <td data-bbox="1003 1212 1176 1273">Unit ID</td> <td data-bbox="1176 1212 1554 1273">222729</td> </tr> </table>	ID linking with structure footprint	Building ID	204954		Parcel ID	204954	Unique ID linking to buildings	Building ID	204954	Unique ID of building units	Unit ID	222729	<p>Satisfactory</p>	
ID linking with structure footprint	Building ID	204954													
	Parcel ID	204954													
Unique ID linking to buildings	Building ID	204954													
Unique ID of building units	Unit ID	222729													

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations				
	<p>The percentage of the number of complete building records + number of complete building units) to the number of building records needed for meeting base or stretch target (– see 1.1.) + total number of building units filtered for legal entities is as follows:</p> $\frac{204954 \times 100}{364111.2} = 56.29\%$						
<p>4. The size of the land parcel is documented by a polygon on a map/indicated as ParcelArea in the file?</p>	<p>IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records for the variable <b>Parcel Area</b> in the file with <b>parcel records</b> to all vacant parcel records submitted as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="759 730 1330 895"> <tr> <td>ParcelArea</td> <td>115328</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vacant Parcel submitted</td> <td>5094</td> </tr> </table> $\frac{115328 \times 100}{5094} = 2264.00\%$	ParcelArea	115328	Vacant Parcel submitted	5094	Satisfactory	
ParcelArea	115328						
Vacant Parcel submitted	5094						
<p>5. The parcel is linked to buildings (one to one or one to many)?</p>	<p>IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records for the variable <b>Parcel ID</b> in the <b>building</b> records file) to all records needed for meeting base target as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="759 1206 1574 1323"> <tr> <td>ParcelID</td> <td>Enumeration Parcel GUID (Base Target Number for the State)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>204954</td> <td>364111.2</td> </tr> </table> $\frac{204954 \times 100}{364111.2}$	ParcelID	Enumeration Parcel GUID (Base Target Number for the State)	204954	364111.2	Satisfactory	
ParcelID	Enumeration Parcel GUID (Base Target Number for the State)						
204954	364111.2						

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations										
	$\frac{364111.2}{364111.2} = 56.29\%$												
6. The number of occupancy units within the property are included?	<p>a. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records for the variable <b>No of Units</b> in the <b>building</b> records file) to all records needed for meeting base target as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="759 459 1585 568"> <tr> <td>No of Units</td> <td>204954</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Base Target</td> <td>364111.2</td> </tr> </table> $\frac{204954}{364111.2} \times 100 = 56.29\%$ <p>b. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records for the variable <b>StructPres</b> in the <b>Parcel</b> records file to all vacant parcel records submitted as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="759 842 1585 959"> <tr> <td>StructPres</td> <td>115328</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Base Target</td> <td>364111.2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vacant Parcel</td> <td>5094</td> </tr> </table> <p>Structure Presence in parcel records to all vacant parcel records:</p> $\frac{115328}{5094} \times 100 = 2,263\%$ <p>Structure Presence in parcel records to Base Target:</p> $\frac{115328}{364111.2} \times 100 = 31.67\%$	No of Units	204954	Base Target	364111.2	StructPres	115328	Base Target	364111.2	Vacant Parcel	5094	Satisfactory	
No of Units	204954												
Base Target	364111.2												
StructPres	115328												
Base Target	364111.2												
Vacant Parcel	5094												

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations																
<p>7. Has the following information been included in each of the property records of the State:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Main Use</li> <li>ii. Occupancy Type</li> <li>iii. Number of dwelling units</li> <li>iv. No of floors</li> <li>v. Age of building</li> <li>vi. Wall material</li> <li>vii. Roof material</li> <li>viii. Formal/Informal document</li> <li>ix. Access to sewerage, water, waste disposal and electricity</li> </ul>	<p>a. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records in the <b>building</b> records file for each of the following variables: (BldgUse; OccupType; NoOfFloors; BldgAge; WallMat; RoofMat; BldgArea; Picture)/ all records needed for meeting base target as follows:</p> $\frac{204954}{364111.2} \times 100 = 56.29\%$ <table border="1" data-bbox="759 625 1572 1010"> <tbody> <tr><td>BldgUse</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>OccupType</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>NoOfFloors</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>BldgAge</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>WallMat</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>RoofMat</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>BldgArea</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>Picture</td><td>YES</td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p>b. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records in the <b>parcel</b> file for each of the following variables: (Document; Water; Sewerage; Power; Waste)/ total number of vacant parcel records as follows:</p> <p>Complete records in parcel file to all vacant parcel records:</p> $\frac{115328}{\dots} \times 100$	BldgUse	YES	OccupType	YES	NoOfFloors	YES	BldgAge	YES	WallMat	YES	RoofMat	YES	BldgArea	YES	Picture	YES	Satisfactory	
BldgUse	YES																		
OccupType	YES																		
NoOfFloors	YES																		
BldgAge	YES																		
WallMat	YES																		
RoofMat	YES																		
BldgArea	YES																		
Picture	YES																		



Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests	Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations												
	<p style="text-align: center;">5094 = 2,263%</p> <p>Complete records in parcel file to Base Target:  <math display="block">\frac{115328 \times 100}{364111.2} = 31.67\%</math></p> <table border="1" data-bbox="759 518 1559 727"> <tr><td>Document</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>Water</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>Sewerage</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>Power</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>Waste</td><td>YES</td></tr> </table>	Document	YES	Water	YES	Sewerage	YES	Power	YES	Waste	YES				
Document	YES														
Water	YES														
Sewerage	YES														
Power	YES														
Waste	YES														
<p>8. Are the ownership characteristics captured?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Single or multiple owner</li> <li>ii. Telephone</li> <li>iii. Address</li> </ul>	<p>a. IVA computed the percentage of the number of complete records in the <b>parcel</b> records file for each of the following variables: (OwnerName; TypeOwner; ParcelUse; OccupType; OwnerPhone; ParcelAddr)/ total number of vacant parcel records as follows:  <math display="block">\frac{115296 \times 100}{5094} = 2263.37\%</math></p> <table border="1" data-bbox="759 1034 1559 1284"> <tr><td>OwnerName</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>TypeOwner</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>ParcelUse</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>OccupType</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>OwnerPhone</td><td>YES</td></tr> <tr><td>ParcelAddr</td><td>YES</td></tr> </table>	OwnerName	YES	TypeOwner	YES	ParcelUse	YES	OccupType	YES	OwnerPhone	YES	ParcelAddr	YES	Satisfactory	
OwnerName	YES														
TypeOwner	YES														
ParcelUse	YES														
OccupType	YES														
OwnerPhone	YES														
ParcelAddr	YES														

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
2	1. The property records are stored in an electronic database?	<p>a. IVA obtained an electronic copy of the Property records. Copy Submitted in MS Excel which has been retained in the file.</p> <p>b. The Server in which the Property records were stored electronically is as follows:</p> <p>All data endpoint  <a href="https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/parcels">https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/parcels</a>            Parcels endpoint  <a href="https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewParcel?ParcelID=30225610">https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewParcel?ParcelID=30225610</a>            Building endpoint  <a href="https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewBuilding?ParcelID=30225610">https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewBuilding?ParcelID=30225610</a>            Building units endpoint  <a href="https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewBuildingUnit?ParcelID=30225610">https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewBuildingUnit?ParcelID=30225610</a></p> <p>Location: Cloud</p> <p>c. The State provided documentation showing IP/URL of Server as:</p> <p>All data endpoint  <a href="https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/parcels">https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/parcels</a>            Parcels endpoint  <a href="https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewParcel?ParcelID=30225610">https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewParcel?ParcelID=30225610</a>            Building endpoint  <a href="https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewBuilding?ParcelID=30225610">https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewBuilding?ParcelID=30225610</a>            Building units endpoint  <a href="https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewBuildingUnit?ParcelID=30225610">https://lasg-dev.pts.ng/api/viewBuildingUnit?ParcelID=30225610</a></p>	Satisfactory	
	2. The property record database is accessible to SIRS/SBIR in electronic format?	<p>a. The SIRS has been granted access to the database. A demand notice has been provided as evidence.</p> <p>b. IVA visited the URL provided by the State to demonstrate Access to the Billing Software via IP/URL as follows:</p> <p><a href="https://lasg.pts.ng/">https://lasg.pts.ng/</a>            Username : wuser@mailinator.com            Password : 09918C#6E3BF2F</p>	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
		<p>IVA was able to download the demand notices from the URLs provided by the State. A screenshot of the page has been retained in a file.</p> <p>c. IVA has obtained API Documentation listing parameters.</p>		
	3. The database has started being used to issue demand notices?	<p>a. The State shared sample payment receipts and demand notices which have been retained in the file.</p> <p>b. IVA carried out spot checks of the Billing System for five randomly selected properties. The parcel ID generated the property owner, property owner address and the land size.</p> <p>The following links were obtained from the spot checks:</p> <p>1. 30123259 - <a href="https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/558286">https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/558286</a></p> <p>2. 20111214 - <a href="https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/96637">https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/96637</a></p> <p>3. 30200662 - <a href="https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/336211">https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/336211</a></p> <p>4. E2200000000181951 - <a href="https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/995190">https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/995190</a></p> <p>5. E641380468 - <a href="https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/995194">https://lasg.pts.ng/property_editor/viewProperty/995194</a></p>	Satisfactory	
3	1. Has the state issued a regulation that mandates that property data collected is shared with MDAs?	<p>a. IVA has obtained and retained a copy of the regulation.</p> <p>b. The regulation was signed by the Honourable Commissioner of Finance. The law came into effect on 10<sup>th</sup> June 2022.</p>	Satisfactory	

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Tests		Approach for assessment	Conclusion	Recommendations
		c. IVA confirmed that the regulation mandates the state to share the data collected with MDAs in line with the key requirements captured in the draft model regulations issued to all states.		
	2. States have distributed the regulations to appropriate MDAs and the SIRS/SBIR?	a. IVA has obtained from the State, a report with supporting evidence that the state has distributed the regulations to appropriate MDAs and the SIRS/SBIR.	Satisfactory	
	3. A copy of the tax demand notice for property related charges/taxes?	a. IVA obtained a copy of the updated demand notice. b. IVA obtained a copy of the Amended notice and confirmed that it includes the geotag (Parcel ID) and it provides the information that will allow any party to access the geotag information. c. The demand notices do includes details of the taxes and charges. It does not include information on discounts for early payment; neither do the notices contain penalties for late payment. It only indicates "Pasting of notice of default on the property will serve as final reminder"	Satisfactory	
	4. A tax demand notice for property related charges/taxes has been amended to include geotag of property?	IVA confirmed that the demand notices included the following Building ID geotag details:  1. Parcel ID 2. Coordinates	Satisfactory	

### 3. Response from the State

---

The State should please use the table below for their response.

S/N	State Response to the draft report	IVA Follow-up, response, treatment
1	<p>Good evening and thank you for the mail. I am directed to acknowledge to effect for cooperation we are enjoying from you on this project. further, you are to note that the Lagos State Collection and distribution of data in property Tax Regulation, 2022, distribution list earlier forwarded to proof that the regulation has been distributed to stakeholder during a State Executive Committee Meeting by the Honourable Commissioner for Finance pending the printing of the regulations by the Gazette Office. Thank you.</p> <p>ABAYOMI NURUDEEN</p>	The State's response is noted.
2		
3		
4		